

The
G7 Research Group
at the Munk School of Global Affairs and Public Policy at Trinity College
in the University of Toronto presents the

2019 G7 Biarritz Summit Second Interim Compliance Report

27 August 2019 — 3 June 2020

Prepared by
Meagan Byrd
and the G7 Research Group

21 June 2020

www.g7.utoronto.ca
g7@utoronto.ca
[@g7_rg](https://twitter.com/g7_rg)

“We have meanwhile set up a process and there are also independent institutions monitoring which objectives of our G7 meetings we actually achieve. When it comes to these goals we have a compliance rate of about 80%, according to the University of Toronto. Germany, with its 87%, comes off pretty well. That means that next year too, under the Japanese G7 presidency, we are going to check where we stand in comparison to what we have discussed with each other now. So a lot of what we have resolved to do here together is something that we are going to have to work very hard at over the next few months. But I think that it has become apparent that we, as the G7, want to assume responsibility far beyond the prosperity in our own countries. That’s why today’s outreach meetings, that is the meetings with our guests, were also of great importance.”

Chancellor Angela Merkel, Schloss Elmau, 8 June 2015

G7 summits are a moment for people to judge whether aspirational intent is met by concrete commitments. The G7 Research Group provides a report card on the implementation of G7 and G20 commitments. It is a good moment for the public to interact with leaders and say, you took a leadership position on these issues — a year later, or three years later, what have you accomplished?

Achim Steiner, Administrator, United Nations Development Programme,
in G7 Canada: The 2018 Charlevoix Summit



At Trinity College
1 Devonshire Place
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 3K7
T: 416.946.8900 F: 416.946.8915

At the Observatory
315 Bloor Street West
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 0A7
T: 416.946.8929 F: 416.946.8877

www.g7.utoronto.ca
munkschool.utoronto.ca

At the Canadiana Gallery
14 Queen’s Park Crescent West
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 3K9
T: 416.978.5120 F: 416.978.5079

Contents

Introduction	3
Research Team	4
Lead Analysts	4
Compliance Analysts	4
Summary	6
The Second Interim Compliance Score	6
Compliance by Member	6
Compliance by Commitment	6
The Compliance Gap Between Members	6
Future Research and Reports	7
Table A: 2019 Priority Commitments Selected for Assessment	8
Table B: 2019 G7 Biarritz Second Interim Compliance Scores	10
Table C: 2019 G7 Biarritz Second Interim Compliance Scores by Member	11
Table D: 2019 G7 Biarritz Second Interim Compliance Scores by Commitment	12
1. Digital Economy: Digital Infrastructure	13
2. Digital Economy: Digital Democracy	27
3. Digital Economy: Artificial Intelligence	49
4. Gender: Gender Equality	74
5. Gender: Affirmative Finance Action for Women in Africa	96
6. Gender: Women’s Entrepreneurship in Africa	115
7. Gender: STEM Education	142
8. Regional Security: Iran	159
9. Regional Security: G5 Sahel Security and Development	192
10. Regional Security: G5 Sahel Police	217
11. Development: G5 Sahel	234
12. Development: Sustainable Development Goals	256
13. Development: Entrepreneurship in Africa	295
14. Trade: World Trade Organization Reform	310
15. Trade: Tax Policy	321
16. Health: Primary Health Care	340
17. Health: Universal Health Coverage	358
18. Health: Mental Health	423
19. Environment: Biodiversity	440
20. Crime and Corruption: Procurement	472
21. Education: G5 Sahel	482

14. Trade: World Trade Organization Reform

“[Therefore, the G7 wishes to overhaul the WTO [World Trade Organization] to improve effectiveness of eliminating] unfair trade practices.”

G7 Biarritz Leaders’ Declaration

Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Canada		0	
France			+1
Germany			+1
Italy	-1		
Japan			+1
United Kingdom			+1
United States		0	
European Union			+1
Average	+0.50 (75%)		

Background

In October 1947, the first international trade regulation agreement was signed, known as the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT).²³¹⁰ The agreement came into effect on January 1948 and regulated international trade until January 1995, when it was replaced by an institution with wider breadth: the World Trade Organization (WTO).²³¹¹ While GATT focused on reciprocal reductions in tariffs on manufactured goods, the WTO also included measures relating to non-tariff trade barriers, such as subsidy policies and regulatory standards.²³¹² At the Uruguay Round in 1994, the WTO introduced new measures and policies intended to mitigate unfair trade practices and allow countries to fight against unfair trade practices within WTO framework through a dispute settlement process.²³¹³ These policies included the Anti-Dumping Agreement, Subsidies and Countervailing Measures, Safeguards, Trade Policy Review Mechanism, Dispute Settlement Understanding, and several industry-specific measures to ensure fair practices across all industries around the world.²³¹⁴

Discussions regarding unfair trade practices first appeared in the 1982 G7 summit in Versailles, where leaders pledged to “rule out the use of [their] exchange rates to gain unfair competitive advantages.”²³¹⁵ After the Versailles Summit, “unfair trade practices” were not mentioned again at G7 summits until the 2009 L’Aquila Summit, where the term “level playing field” was first applied in an economic context.²³¹⁶ However, since the L’Aquila Summit, the terms “level playing field” or “unfair

²³¹⁰ The GATT years: from Havana to Marrakesh, World Trade Organization (Geneva). Access Date: 7 September 2018. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/fact4_e.htm.

²³¹¹ The GATT years: from Havana to Marrakesh, World Trade Organization (Geneva). Access Date: 7 September 2018. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/fact4_e.htm.

²³¹² The Uruguay Round, World Trade Organization (Geneva). Access Date: 7 September 2018. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/fact5_e.htm.

²³¹³ WTO Legal Texts, World Trade Organization (Geneva). Access Date: 10 November 2018. https://www.wto.org/english/docs_e/legal_e/legal_e.htm#a#antidump.

²³¹⁴ WTO Legal Texts, World Trade Organization (Geneva). Access Date: 10 November 2018. https://www.wto.org/english/docs_e/legal_e/legal_e.htm#a#antidump.

²³¹⁵ Declaration of the Seven Heads of State and Government and Representatives of the European Communities, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 12 October 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/1982versailles/communique.html>.

²³¹⁶ Responsible leadership for a sustainable future, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 12 October 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/2009laquila/2009-declaration.pdf>.

trade practices” have been mentioned in every communiqué, except for the 2010 Muskoka Summit. At the 2017 Taormina Summit leaders pledged to “[stand] firm against all unfair trade practices.”²³¹⁷ The Taormina Summit also marked a shift in the G7’s prioritization of eliminating unfair trade practices, with the communiqué listing out for the first time in detail the types of practices that the G7 considers to be unfair, including protectionism, dumping, barriers to trade, forced technology transfers, subsidies, and other practices that would “distort markets.”²³¹⁸ At the Biarritz Summit, inequality was a primary focus across all topics discussed. G7 members called for “open and fair world trade” and for “the stability of the global economy.”²³¹⁹ The validity and effectiveness of certain WTO rulings has been called into question recently, particularly with regards to the recent U.S.-China trade war.²³²⁰ As such, the topic of trade at Biarritz was focused on revitalizing the WTO to improve effectiveness on multiple fronts, including intellectual property protection, dispute resolution, and unfair trade practices.²³²¹

Commitment Features

G7 members wish to overhaul the WTO in efforts to combat unfair trade practices. Examples of unfair trade practices included in the 2017 Taormina communiqué include “dumping, discriminatory non-tariff barriers, forced technology transfers, subsidies, and other support by governments and related institutions that distort markets.”²³²² Not included in the 2017 Taormina communiqué, but also considered as unfair trade practices are tariffs, quotas, and countervailing duties not permitted by the WTO.

By committing to “overhaul,” G7 members are expressing a desire to change the structure and/or rules of the WTO. One example of an overhaul could be to change the consensus principle on which governance of the WTO relies. With a membership of 160 countries with varying stages of economic, social, and political development, it is difficult to get all 160 countries to agree on issues. An alternative could be a majoritarian or representative decision-making process. Another could be to allow plurilateral agreements involving subset of members within the WTO structure.²³²³ A second example of an overhaul could be to change the bodies and rules involved in the dispute resolution process.

The G7 members have specified in their commitment that the overhaul should “improve the effectiveness” of eliminating unfair trade practices. For evaluating this commitment, to “improve the effectiveness” will be understood in two primary ways. The first is to expand the set of unfair trade practices that are regulated under the WTO. An example could be to introduce new WTO rules on the trade of agricultural products. The second is to increase the speed and success rates with which unfair trade practices are sanctioned by the WTO and subsequently removed by the country imposing them. This could involve changing the rules of the dispute settlement mechanism so that

²³¹⁷ G7 Taormina Leaders’ Communiqué, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 12 October 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/2017taormina/communique.html>.

²³¹⁸ G7 Taormina Leaders’; Communiqué, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 12 October 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/2017taormina/communique.html>.

²³¹⁹ G7 Leaders’ Declaration, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 10 November 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/2019biarritz/declaration-of-leaders.html>.

²³²⁰ G7 Leaders’ Declaration, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 10 November 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/2019biarritz/declaration-of-leaders.html>.

²³²¹ G7 Leaders’ Declaration, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 10 November 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/2019biarritz/declaration-of-leaders.html>.

²³²² G7 Taormina Leaders’ Communiqué, G7 Information Centre (Toronto). Access Date: 12 October 2019. <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/summit/2017taormina/communique.html>.

²³²³ The End of Bretton Woods and the Future of the International Trading System, Edward Elgar (Cheltenham). Access Date: 7 December 2019. <https://elgar.blog/2015/01/22/the-end-of-bretton-woods-and-the-future-of-the-international-trading-system-by-michael-trebilcock/>.

cases are conducted on a faster timeline. Regardless of whether it is the first or second method, the goal is to “eliminate” unfair trade practices, which means “to put an end to.” However, when “eliminate” is understood together with “improve the effectiveness,” the measures adopted by a G7 member do not need to completely end unfair trade practices, but must work toward that goal.

The extent to which a G7 member fulfills this commitment will be measured by a depth analysis. A G7 member “fully wishing” to overhaul the WTO’s effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practice will have publicly put forward proposals and engaged in multilateral negotiations in pursuit of this goal. A G7 member “partially wishing” to overhaul the WTO to improve effectiveness with regard to eliminating unfair trade practice will have publicly put forward proposals, but not have engaged in multilateral negotiations in pursuit of this goal. Successful negotiation of a multilateral agreement that changes WTO rules is not necessary for demonstrating “fully wishing” or “partially wishing,” as success depends on multiple countries reaching an agreement, including non-G7 members who have not made such a commitment.

In order for the G7 member to achieve full compliance score, it must have publicly put forward proposals and engaged in multilateral negotiations to change the rules and/or structure of the WTO to more effectively eliminate unfair trade practices. To earn a score of partial compliance, the G7 member must have publicly put forward proposals to change the rules and/or structure of the WTO to more effectively eliminate unfair trade practices, but not have engaged in multilateral negotiations. Non-compliance, or a score of -1, refers to G7 members who have not taken any action to more effectively eliminate unfair trade practices through the WTO.

Because the European Union represents its members in formal negotiations, Germany, Italy and France as EU members can achieve full compliance if they provide major, repeated, high-level public support for WTO reform and reform negotiations. A score of partial compliance will be awarded for one major, high-level act of public support for WTO reform negotiations. A score of non-compliance will be awarded if the member takes no action towards the aforementioned criteria.

Note: Actions taken between 13 April and 3 June 2020 have been included in this report but were not included in the version sent out for stakeholder feedback.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	G7 member has NEITHER publicly put forward proposals NOR engaged in multilateral negotiations to change the rules and/or structure of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to eliminate unfair trade practices more effectively. For European Union members, G7 member makes no high-level acts of public support for WTO reform and reform negotiations.
0	G7 member has publicly put forward proposals OR has engaged in multilateral negotiations to change the rules and/or structure of the WTO to more effectively eliminate unfair trade practices. For EU members, G7 member provides a major act of high-level support for WTO reform and reform negotiations.
+1	G7 member has publicly put forward proposals AND has engaged in multilateral negotiations to change the rules and/or structure of the WTO to more effectively eliminate unfair trade practices. For EU members, G7 member provides major, repeated, high-level public support for WTO reform and reform negotiations.

*Compliance Director: Ian Stansbury
Lead Analyst: Jessica Rapson*

Canada: 0

Canada has partially complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

On 10 December 2019, International Trade Minister Mary Ng said that Canada would work with all member states of the WTO in order to address and resolve the breakdown of the organization's dispute resolution system.²³²⁴ Minister Ng also reiterated Canada's commitment to WTO reform through the Ottawa Group and the Canada-European Union interim bilateral agreement, and that Canada is open to interim agreements until the situation is fully resolved.

On 27 March 2020, International Trade Minister Mary Ng stated that the Government of Canada is taking strong action to strengthen the rules-based trading system with the WTO.²³²⁵ Mary Ng announced that following statements by ministers at Davos, Switzerland, Canada and 15 other members of the WTO have put in place the Multi-party Interim Arrangement for allowing appeals of panel reports in trade disputes.²³²⁶ The arrangement will allow WTO members to solve trade disputes amongst themselves and will be in place until the WTO Appellate Body is fully operational.²³²⁷

Canada has engaged in multilateral negotiations to address issues within the WTO, however, has not publicly put forward any proposals on WTO reform.

Thus, Canada has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Adarsh Addepalli and Ian Stansbury

France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

On 19 September 2019, Finance Minister Bruno Le Maire met with German Finance Minister Olaf Scholz and German Economics Affairs Minister at the 50th Franco-German Economic and Financial Council in Paris.²³²⁸ Both countries aim to preserve the multilateral rules-based trading system with the WTO at its centre and leading its reform, focusing on issues of dispute settlement, industrial subsidies, and forced transfer of technologies.²³²⁹

On 10 October 2019, France and Canada co-host a session on trade and climate change as part of the WTO Public Forum with International Chamber of Commerce.²³³⁰ The French delegation, along with the Canadian delegation and the ICC, advocate that new international trade rules can foster and

²³²⁴ Canada will work to resolve WTO impasse, says trade minister, Radio Canada International (Ottawa). 10 December 2019. Access Date: 3 January 2020. <https://www.rcinet.ca/en/2019/12/10/canada-will-work-to-resolve-wto-impasse-says-trade-minister/>

²³²⁵ Statement on Multi-party Interim Arrangement for appealing trade disputes through the WTO, Government of Canada (Ottawa). 27 March 2020. Access Date: 25 April 2020. <https://www.canada.ca/en/global-affairs/news/2020/03/statement-on-multi-party-interim-arrangement-for-appealing-trade-disputes-through-wto.html>

²³²⁶ Statement on Multi-party Interim Arrangement for appealing trade disputes through the WTO, Government of Canada (Ottawa). 27 March 2020. Access Date: 25 April 2020. <https://www.canada.ca/en/global-affairs/news/2020/03/statement-on-multi-party-interim-arrangement-for-appealing-trade-disputes-through-wto.html>

²³²⁷ Statement on Multi-party Interim Arrangement for appealing trade disputes through the WTO, Government of Canada (Ottawa). 27 March 2020. Access Date: 25 April 2020. <https://www.canada.ca/en/global-affairs/news/2020/03/statement-on-multi-party-interim-arrangement-for-appealing-trade-disputes-through-wto.html>

²³²⁸ 50th Franco-German Economic and Financial Council, Federal Ministry of Finance (Berlin) 19 September 2019. Access Date: 13 April 2020. <https://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/Content/EN/Standardartikel/Topics/Europe/Articles/2019-09-19-D-F-ECOFIN.html>

²³²⁹ 50th Franco-German Economic and Financial Council, The Portal for the Economy, Finance, Action and Public Accounts (Paris) 19 September 2019. Access Date: 13 April 2020. https://www.economie.gouv.fr/recherche-resultat?search_api_views_fulltext=wto+&sort_by=search_api_relevance&afficher_extraits=oui&gid=

²³³⁰ ICC Launches consultations series to discuss nexus between trade and climate, International Chamber of Commerce (Paris, Geneva, New York) 3 October 2019. Access Date: 24 November 2019. <https://iccwbo.org/media-wall/news-speeches/icc-launches-consultation-series-to-discuss-the-nexus-between-trade-and-climate/>

amplify research and innovation efforts in the private sector, and promote the reduction of tariff and non-tariff barriers.²³³¹

On 16 October 2019, President Emmanuel Macron and German Chancellor Angela Merkel met for a Franco-German Council of Ministers meeting in Toulouse and reaffirmed the two countries' willingness to protect and strengthen the multilateral trading system based on a reformed WTO.²³³² The two countries are looking to preserve the multilateralism objectives and procedures of this WTO reform.²³³³

On 6 November 2019, President Macron met with Chinese Premier Li Keqiang to discuss economic cooperation between France and China. The two leaders also agreed to improve bilateral coordination with regards to policy stance on WTO reform, in an effort to “better safeguard free trade and multilateralism.”²³³⁴

On 11 November 2019, Secretary of State to the Minister of Europe and Foreign Affairs Jean-Baptiste LeMoyne attending a meeting of EU trade ministers, where he reiterated the need for “ambitious reform” of the WTO and said that France supported the European Commission’s efforts toward WTO reform.²³³⁵

On 12 November 2019, Minister Le Maire spoke at the Paris Peace Forum panel on “The Future of Trade Rules,” expressing that no WTO reform can be carried out without reshaping economic and capitalistic development models which have brought about serious inequalities and environmental damages.²³³⁶ Further, that new political and economic principles need to be redefined before rebuilding a multilateral trading system.²³³⁷

On 21 November 2019, Minister Lemoyne attended a Foreign Affairs Council meeting focused on trade.²³³⁸ The EU trade ministers meeting covered three major trade areas: WTO reform and preparations for the WTO’s 12th ministerial conference to be held in June 2020, trade with the United States and EU trade agreements.²³³⁹

²³³¹ Public Forum 2019, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 10 October 2019. Access Date: 8 Dec 2019.

²³³² France-Germany: What ambition for Europe? Institut Montaigne (France). Access Date: 19 December 2019. <https://www.institutmontaigne.org/en/blog/france-germany-what-ambition-europe>.

²³³³ France-Germany: What ambition for Europe? Institut Montaigne (France). Access Date: 19 December 2019. <https://www.institutmontaigne.org/en/blog/france-germany-what-ambition-europe>.

²³³⁴ Li Keqiang Meets with President Emmanuel Macron of France, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 6 November 2019. Access Date: 3 January 2020. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1714263.shtml.

²³³⁵ EU - Jean-Baptiste Lemoyne attending Foreign Affairs Council in trade format (Brussels, 21 November 2019), France Diplomatie (Paris) 21 November 2019. Access Date: 3 January 2020. <https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/french-foreign-policy/european-union/news/article/eu-jean-baptiste-lemoyne-attending-foreign-affairs-council-in-trade-format>.

²³³⁶ The Future of Trade, Paris Peace Forum (Paris) 12 November 2019. Access Date: 13 April 2020. <https://parispeaceforum.org/publication/the-future-of-trade-rules/>.

²³³⁷ The Future of Trade, Paris Peace Forum (Paris) 12 November 2019. Access Date: 13 April 2020. <https://parispeaceforum.org/publication/the-future-of-trade-rules/>.

²³³⁸ EU – Jean-Baptiste Lemoyne attending Foreign Affairs Council in trade format, France Diplomacy (Paris) 21 November 2019. Access Date: 17 June 2020. <https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/french-foreign-policy/europe/news/article/eu-jean-baptiste-lemoyne-attending-foreign-affairs-council-in-trade-format>

²³³⁹ EU – Jean-Baptiste Lemoyne attending Foreign Affairs Council in trade format, France Diplomacy (Paris) 21 November 2019. Access Date: 17 June 2020. <https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/french-foreign-policy/europe/news/article/eu-jean-baptiste-lemoyne-attending-foreign-affairs-council-in-trade-format>

On 7 January 2020, Minister Le Maire met with EU Trade Commissioner Phil Hogan to discuss reforms to the WTO, among other financial topics.²³⁴⁰ Minister Le Maire said that “WTO reform is one of France’s top priorities,” and that “France is ready to support all efforts allowing a jump-start of WTO reform negotiations and the solving of the problems affecting its dispute settlement body.”²³⁴¹

As an EU member, France has taken steps to overhaul the WTO to improve effectiveness in eliminating unfair trade practices as it has engaged in multilateral negotiations, and has made repeated, high-level acts of support for WTO reform.

Thus, France has received a score of +1.

Analysts: Tirtha Shah and Ian Stansbury

Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

On 16 October 2019, Chancellor Angela Merkel and French President Emmanuel Macron met for a Franco-German Council of Ministers meeting in Toulouse and reaffirmed the two countries’ willingness to protect and strengthen the multilateral trading system based on a reformed WTO.²³⁴² The two countries are looking to preserve the multilateralism objectives and procedures of this WTO reform.²³⁴³

On 1 November 2019, Germany and India released a joint statement during Chancellor Merkel’s visit to India, reiterating both countries’ strong support for a rules-based trading system, restoration of the WTO dispute settlement system and reformation of the WTO without undermining the organization fundamental principles.²³⁴⁴

As an EU member, Germany has engaged in multilateral negotiations to eliminate unfair trade practices, and had made repeated, high-level acts of public support for WTO reform.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Wing Ka Tsang

Italy: -1

Italy has not complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

²³⁴⁰ France, US set two-week target for resolving digital tax spat, Reuters (Paris) 7 January 2020. Access Date: 9 January 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-france-usa-tax/france-us-set-two-week-target-for-resolving-digital-tax-spat-idUSKBN1Z60SM>.

²³⁴¹ France, US set two-week target for resolving digital tax spat, Reuters (Paris) 7 January 2020. Access Date: 9 January 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-france-usa-tax/france-us-set-two-week-target-for-resolving-digital-tax-spat-idUSKBN1Z60SM>.

²³⁴² France-Germany: What ambition for Europe? Institut Montaigne (France). Access Date: 19 December 2019. <https://www.institutmontaigne.org/en/blog/france-germany-what-ambition-europe>.

²³⁴³ France-Germany: What ambition for Europe? Institut Montaigne (France). Access Date: 19 December 2019. <https://www.institutmontaigne.org/en/blog/france-germany-what-ambition-europe>.

²³⁴⁴ Joint statement during the visit of Chancellor of Germany to India, Ministry of External Affairs (India). Access Date: 19 December 2019. https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/31991/Joint_Statement_during_the_visit_of_Chancellor_of_Germany_to_India.

Currently, Italy has stated support for the removal of fisheries subsidies as well as the initiatives to refine the rules of digital commerce.²³⁴⁵ Additionally, Italy supports the two-level dispute resolution system and Appellate Body.²³⁴⁶ However, Italy has not put forward proposals nor has it engaged in multilateral negotiations on WTO reform. No actions were found for this report after searching publicly available online sources published by the government, relevant ministries and international organizations.²³⁴⁷

As an EU member, Italy has also not offered any acts of high-level support for WTO reform and reform negotiations beyond sending Ivan Scalfarotto, State Secretary for Foreign Affairs and International Co-operation, to participate in a Foreign Affairs Council meeting focused on trade on 21 November 2019, which discussed WTO reform and preparations for the WTO's 12th ministerial conference to be held in June 2020.²³⁴⁸

Thus, Italy has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Ayaka Behro

Japan: +1

Japan has fully complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

On December 11, 2019, Japan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs released a press release stating the country's position to reform the WTO Appellate Body.²³⁴⁹ Japan has contributed to stimulating negotiations at the WTO by presenting a concrete proposal by April 2020.²³⁵⁰ With the country co-chairing negotiations on the trade aspects of electronic commerce at the WTO to progress international regulation of the digital economy.²³⁵¹

On January 14, 2020, in a joint statement by the European Union, United States and Japan, the countries announced their continued cooperation on WTO reform to include increased compliance with existing WTO notification obligations.²³⁵² The three countries agreed that the current list of prohibited subsidies under WTO guidelines is insufficient in undertaking market distorting subsidization in certain jurisdiction.²³⁵³ Additionally, the three countries concluded that new types of

²³⁴⁵ World Trade Organization (Geneva). Access Date: 25 April 2020.

https://italiarappginevra.esteri.it/rappginevra/en/italia_e_onu/omc/diritti-umani.html.

²³⁴⁶ World Trade Organization (Geneva). Access Date: 25 April 2020.

https://italiarappginevra.esteri.it/rappginevra/en/italia_e_onu/omc/diritti-umani.html.

²³⁴⁷ This non-compliance was determined after research of the following websites: www.bbc.com, www.nytimes.com, www.governo.it, www.esteri.it/mae/en, <https://www.repubblica.it/>, <https://www.corriere.it/>, <https://www.wto.org/>, <https://www.oecd.org/italy/>, <https://www.mise.gov.it/> and www.ansa.it.

²³⁴⁸ Foreign Affairs Council (Trade), 21 November 2019. European Council of the European Union. Access Date: 18 June 2020. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/meetings/fac/2019/11/21/>.

²³⁴⁹ Paralysis of the WTO's Appellate Body and WTO Reform (Statement by Foreign Minister MOTEGI Toshimitsu). 11 December 2019. Access Date: 25 April 2020. https://www.mofa.go.jp/press/release/press1e_000140.html

²³⁵⁰ Paralysis of the WTO's Appellate Body and WTO Reform (Statement by Foreign Minister MOTEGI Toshimitsu). December 11, 2019. Access Date: 25 April 2020. https://www.mofa.go.jp/press/release/press1e_000140.html

²³⁵¹ Paralysis of the WTO's Appellate Body and WTO Reform (Statement by Foreign Minister MOTEGI Toshimitsu). December 11, 2019. Access Date: 25 April 2020. https://www.mofa.go.jp/press/release/press1e_000140.html.

²³⁵² Joint Statement of the Trilateral Meeting of the Trade Ministers of Japan, the United States and the European Union. January 14, 2020. Access Date: 25 April 2020. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2020/january/joint-statement-trilateral-meeting-trade-ministers-japan-united-states-and-european-union>

²³⁵³ Joint Statement of the Trilateral Meeting of the Trade Ministers of Japan, the United States and the European Union. January 14, 2020. Access Date: 25 April 2020. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2020/january/joint-statement-trilateral-meeting-trade-ministers-japan-united-states-and-european-union>

unconditionally prohibited subsidies must be added to the WTO Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures.²³⁵⁴

Japan has put forward several proposals and has engaged in multilateral negotiations on WTO reform.

Thus, Japan has received a score of +1.

Analysts: Ayaka Bebro and Ian Stansbury

United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

On 9 October 2019, International Trade Secretary Liz Truss reiterated the UK's commitment to reforming the WTO at her first WTO address at the International Chamber of Commerce Global dialogue on Trade Reform. In her speech, she put forward the factors the UK would like to see reformed, namely, the dispute settlement system and the Appellate Body.²³⁵⁵ More specifically, Minister Truss said that the UK wants to resolve the Appellate Body Crisis and change the time limits for Appellate Body adjudication on appeals to avoid further future unauthorised overrunning of cases.²³⁵⁶ She also indicated that there is “an urgent need to strengthen the rules on industrial subsidies, state-owned enterprises and forced technology transfer.”²³⁵⁷

On October 9 2019, Minister Truss reaffirmed that the UK will take concrete steps to change the rules and/or structure of the WTO to effectively eliminate unfair trade practices after Britain's exit from the European Union (Brexit) is formalized.²³⁵⁸ Currently, the European Commission speaks for all EU member States at almost all WTO meetings.²³⁵⁹ After Brexit negotiations are finalised, Britain will have its own independent seat at the WTO.²³⁶⁰ Minister Truss indicated that: “when we take our independent seat around the WTO table, I can assure you we will be unapologetic in fighting the forces of protectionism, in favour of genuinely free trade.”²³⁶¹

The United Kingdom has put forward public proposals and has engaged in multilateral negotiations related to WTO reforms.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Amira Higazy

²³⁵⁴ Joint Statement of the Trilateral Meeting of the Trade Ministers of Japan, the United States and the European Union. January 14, 2020. Access Date: 25 April 2020. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2020/january/joint-statement-trilateral-meeting-trade-ministers-japan-united-states-and-european-union>

²³⁵⁵ International Trade Secretary WTO address (London). 9 October 2019. Access Date: 27 November 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/international-trade-secretary-wto-address>.

²³⁵⁶ International Trade Secretary WTO address (London). 9 October 2019. Access Date: 27 November 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/international-trade-secretary-wto-address>.

²³⁵⁷ International Trade Secretary WTO address (London). 9 October 2019. Access Date: 27 November 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/international-trade-secretary-wto-address>.

²³⁵⁸ UK will back WTO reform after Brexit, trade minister says (Geneva). 9 October 2019. Access Date: 27 November 2019. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-wto-britain/uk-will-back-wto-reform-after-brexit-trade-minister-says-idUSKBN1W01RB>.

²³⁵⁹ Member Information The European Union and the WTO. Access Date: 9 December 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/countries_e/european_communities_e.htm.

²³⁶⁰ International Trade Secretary WTO address (London). 9 October 2019. Access Date: 27 November 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/international-trade-secretary-wto-address>.

²³⁶¹ International Trade Secretary WTO address (London). 9 October 2019. Access Date: 27 November 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/international-trade-secretary-wto-address>.

United States: 0

The United States has not complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

On 15 October 2019, Permanent Representative to the WTO Dennis Shea delivered a statement to the WTO General Council, outlining concerns that the United States has with the WTO, and put forward several reformative proposals.²³⁶² Representative Shea also mentioned the US's dissatisfaction with the WTO's dispute mechanism, saying that if changes were not made to address unfair trade practices, the US would continue blocking appointments of judges to the Appellate Body.²³⁶³

On 10 December 2019, the United States allowed the WTO dispute mechanism to stop functioning.²³⁶⁴ The United States began blocking new appointments of the Appellate Body, reducing its seven members to three, and preventing the organization from issuing binding rulings on trade disagreements.²³⁶⁵

On 15 January 2020, the United States, including the European Union and Japan, proposed limiting industrial subsidies by adding four new “unconditionally prohibited subsidies” to the current WTO list of prohibited subsidies.²³⁶⁶ The countries also explored ways to regulate forced technology transfer. Currently, WTO rules prohibit subsidies linked to export performance and dependent on the use of excessively imported domestic goods.²³⁶⁷ The propose subsidies will improve WTO regulatory rules by requiring the subsidizing country to demonstrate that there is no serious negative effect on trade.²³⁶⁸

On 28 February 2020, the United States trade representative delivered President Donald Trump's 2020 Trade Policy Agenda and Annual Report to Congress.²³⁶⁹ The agenda highlighted the State's efforts to change WTO practices, including tabling a transparency proposal that establish appropriate consequences for chronic non-compliance with notification obligations.²³⁷⁰ Another proposal was made to update members' special and differential designations to better reflect WTO current

²³⁶² Statements Delivered to the General Council by Ambassador Dennis Shea U.S. Permanent Representative to the World Trade Organization, US Missions to International Organizations in Geneva (Geneva) 15 October 2019. Access Date: 7 January 2019. <https://geneva.usmission.gov/2019/10/15/statements-by-the-united-states-at-the-wto-general-council-meeting/>.

²³⁶³ Free trade groups urge Trump administration to push forward WTO reform, Xinhua Net (China). Access Date: 19 December 2019. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2019-10/24/c_138497458.htm.

²³⁶⁴ Trump blocks global trade referee powers just ahead of planned China escalation, Market Insider (United States) 10 December 2019. Access Date: 19 December 2019. <https://markets.businessinsider.com/news/stocks/trump-blocks-global-trade-referee-wto-china-tariff-fights-escalate-2019-12-1028752979>.

²³⁶⁵ Trump blocks global trade referee powers just ahead of planned China escalation, Market Insider (United States) 10 December 2019. Access Date: 19 December 2019. <https://markets.businessinsider.com/news/stocks/trump-blocks-global-trade-referee-wto-china-tariff-fights-escalate-2019-12-1028752979>.

²³⁶⁶ Current trade matters, Newsboard, AmCham Germany (Frankfurt) 9 March 2020. Access Date: 14 April 2020. <https://www.amcham.de/newsboard/news/current-trade-matters>.

²³⁶⁷ Current trade matters, Newsboard, AmCham Germany (Frankfurt) 9 March 2020. Access Date: 14 April 2020. <https://www.amcham.de/newsboard/news/current-trade-matters>.

²³⁶⁸ Current trade matters, Newsboard, AmCham Germany (Frankfurt) 9 March 2020. Access Date: 14 April 2020. <https://www.amcham.de/newsboard/news/current-trade-matters>.

²³⁶⁹ Factsheet: The President's 2020 Trade Agenda and Annual Report, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 28 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 15, 2020. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/fact-sheets/2020/february/fact-sheet-presidents-2020-trade-agenda-and-annual-report>.

²³⁷⁰ Factsheet: The President's 2020 Trade Agenda and Annual Report, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 28 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 15, 2020. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/fact-sheets/2020/february/fact-sheet-presidents-2020-trade-agenda-and-annual-report>.

economic realities.²³⁷¹ This caused several WTO members to halt seeking special and differential treatment in trade negotiations.²³⁷²

On 3 March 2020, Ambassador Dennis Shea from the United States delivered a statement to the WTO General Council Meeting.²³⁷³ The U.S. proposed setting objective criteria to determine whether a WTO member may continue to have special and differential treatment.²³⁷⁴ The U.S. stated that certain WTO members were inappropriately seeking special and differentiated treatment in WTO negotiations, and that the proposed criteria would adequately address this issue.²³⁷⁵

The United States has publicly put forward proposals to reform the WTO. However, it has not participated in multilateral negotiations to change the rules or structure of the WTO.

Thus, the United States has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Wing Ka Tsang

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to overhaul the World Trade Organization (WTO) to improve effectiveness of eliminating unfair trade practices.

On 21 October 2019, the European Union agreed on a second interim appeal system with Norway as a means to “secure an effective and binding dispute settlement for any potential trade disputes” in the case that the Appellate Body fails to be operational.²³⁷⁶

On 21 November 2019, the Foreign Affairs Council held a meeting between EU foreign ministers, where ministers reiterated the importance of the WTO and that reform was required in order to maintain a stable international trade system.²³⁷⁷

On 12 December 2019, the European Commission released a proposal that would allow for the EU to enforce international trade rules in the case that the WTO is no longer able to.²³⁷⁸ The proposal

²³⁷¹ Factsheet: The President’s 2020 Trade Agenda and Annual Report, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 28 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 15, 2020. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/fact-sheets/2020/february/fact-sheet-presidents-2020-trade-agenda-and-annual-report>.

²³⁷² Factsheet: The President’s 2020 Trade Agenda and Annual Report, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 28 February 2020. Access Date: 15 March 15, 2020. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/fact-sheets/2020/february/fact-sheet-presidents-2020-trade-agenda-and-annual-report>.

²³⁷³ Statement by Ambassador Dennis Shea at the March 3, 2020 General Council Meeting, U.S. Mission to International Organization in Geneva (Geneva) 3 March 2020. Access Date: 14 April 2020. <https://geneva.usmission.gov/2020/03/03/statements-by-ambassador-dennis-shea-at-the-march-3-2020-general-council-meeting/>.

²³⁷⁴ Statement by Ambassador Dennis Shea at the March 3, 2020 General Council Meeting, U.S. Mission to International Organization in Geneva (Geneva) 3 March 2020. Access Date: 14 April 2020. <https://geneva.usmission.gov/2020/03/03/statements-by-ambassador-dennis-shea-at-the-march-3-2020-general-council-meeting/>.

²³⁷⁵ Statement by Ambassador Dennis Shea at the March 3, 2020 General Council Meeting, U.S. Mission to International Organization in Geneva (Geneva) 3 March 2020. Access Date: 14 April 2020. <https://geneva.usmission.gov/2020/03/03/statements-by-ambassador-dennis-shea-at-the-march-3-2020-general-council-meeting/>.

²³⁷⁶ EU and Norway agree on interim appeal system in wake of World Trade Organization Appellate Body Blockage, European Commission (Brussels) 21 October 2019. Date of Access: 21 December 2019. <https://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=2074>.

²³⁷⁷ Trade Ministers Discussed WTO Reform, EU-US Trade Relations and Implementation of Free Trade Agreements, Council of the European Union (Brussels) 20 November 2019. Access Date: 7 January 2020. https://eu2019.fi/en/article/-/asset_publisher/kauppaministerien-agendalla-wto-n-uudistustyo-eu-n-ja-yhdysvaltojen-kauppa-suhteet-seka-kauppasopimusten-toimeenpano.

was released in response to the WTO Appellate Body being unable to elect new judges in order to make binding decisions on trade disputes.²³⁷⁹ The proposal was made as an effort to maintain the continuity of the international trade system while ongoing negotiations regarding WTO reform continue.²³⁸⁰

On 7 January 2020, Trade Commissioner Phil Hogan met with French Finance Minister Bruno Le Maire to discuss reforms to the WTO, among other financial topics.²³⁸¹ Commissioner Hogan said that the European Commission will “stand by France” in its digital tax dispute with the US, and that the EU “want[s] to see a reform of the WTO” and that the EU “share[s] the US analysis” on reforms.²³⁸²

On 24 January 2020, the European Union, agreed to create a temporary mechanism in order to settle trade disputes following the collapse of the Appellate Body, due to lack of support from the US.²³⁸³ This is a means to continue to the appeal system which had been a means to settle trade disputes with Norway.²³⁸⁴ This, takes those mechanisms and applies it to a total of 15 other countries.²³⁸⁵

On 15 April 2020, the European Union approved the creation of the Multi-Party Interim Appeal Arbitration Arrangement to allow WTO members to solve trade disputes while the WTO Appellate Body is suspended.²³⁸⁶

The European Union has participated in multilateral negotiations on WTO reform and has put forth proposals that would allow for trade system continuity as other WTO reforms continue to be negotiated and implemented.

Thus, the European Union has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Adarsh Addepalli

²³⁷⁸ Commission proposes new tools to enforce Europe's rights in international trade, European Commission (Brussels) 12 December 2019. Access Date: 7 January 2020.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/QANDA_19_6757.

²³⁷⁹ Commission proposes new tools to enforce Europe's rights in international trade, European Commission (Brussels) 12 December 2019. Access Date: 7 January 2020.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/QANDA_19_6757.

²³⁸⁰ Commission proposes new tools to enforce Europe's rights in international trade, European Commission (Brussels) 12 December 2019. Access Date: 7 January 2020.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/QANDA_19_6757.

²³⁸¹ France, US set two-week target for resolving digital tax spat, Reuters (Paris) 7 January 2020. Access Date: 9 January 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-france-usa-tax/france-us-set-two-week-target-for-resolving-digital-tax-spat-idUSKBN1Z60SM>.

²³⁸² France, US set two-week target for resolving digital tax spat, Reuters (Paris) 7 January 2020. Access Date: 9 January 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-france-usa-tax/france-us-set-two-week-target-for-resolving-digital-tax-spat-idUSKBN1Z60SM>.

²³⁸³ EU and Norway agree on interim appeal system in wake of World Trade Organization Appellate Body Blockage, European Commission (Brussels) 21 October 2019. Date of Access: 21 December 2019.

<https://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=2074>.

²³⁸⁴ EU and Norway agree on interim appeal system in wake of World Trade Organization Appellate Body Blockage, European Commission (Brussels) 21 October 2019. Date of Access: 21 December 2019.

<https://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=2074>.

²³⁸⁵ EU, China and 15 others agree temporary fix to WTO crisis (Brussels) 24 January 2020. Date of Access: 13 April 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-trade-wto/eu-china-and-15-others-agree-temporary-fix-to-wto-crisis-idUSKBN1ZN0WM>.

²³⁸⁶ Council approves a multi-party interim appeal arbitration arrangement to solve trade disputes, Council of the European Union (Brussels). 15 April 2020. Access Date: 15 April 2020.

<https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2020/04/15/council-approves-a-multi-party-interim-appeal-arbitration-arrangement-to-solve-trade-disputes/>.