



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO

MUNK
SCHOOL
OF
GLOBAL
AFFAIRS

Join the Global Conversation

G7 Research Group

The
G7 Research Group
at the Munk School of Global Affairs at Trinity College in the University of Toronto
presents the

2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Report

27 May 2017 to 30 January 2018

Prepared by
Katrina Bland, Andrew Liu and Sarah Mariani
G7 Research Group, University of Toronto
17 April 2018, updated on 20 April 2018
www.g7.utoronto.ca
g8@utoronto.ca
[@g7_rg](#) and [@g8rg](#)

“We have meanwhile set up a process and there are also independent institutions monitoring which objectives of our G7 meetings we actually achieve. When it comes to these goals we have a compliance rate of about 80%, according to the University of Toronto. Germany, with its 87%, comes off pretty well. That means that next year too, under the Japanese G7 presidency, we are going to check where we stand in comparison to what we have discussed with each other now. So a lot of what we have resolved to do here together is something that we are going to have to work very hard at over the next few months. But I think that it has become apparent that we, as the G7, want to assume responsibility far beyond the prosperity in our own countries. That’s why today’s outreach meetings, that is the meetings with our guests, were also of great importance.”

Chancellor Angela Merkel, Schloss Elmau, 8 June 2015

Contents

Preface.....	3
Research Team	4
Executive Summary	6
Table A: 2017 Priority Commitments Selected for Assessment*	7
Table B: 2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Scores	9
Table C: 2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Scores by Country	10
Table D: 2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Scores by Commitment	10
1. Terrorism: Aviation and Border Security	11
2. Terrorism: Combating Online Extremism	25
3. Non-proliferation: Nuclear Weapons and Disarmament	40
4. Trade: Protectionism and Trade Practices.....	60
5. Gender: Human Trafficking and Exploitation.....	73
6. Gender: Encouraging Women in the Private Sector.....	88
7. Migration: Addressing the Drivers of Migration	101
8. Climate Change: Energy and Clean Technology	128
9. Climate Change: Paris Agreement	142
10. Food and Agriculture: Food Security and Nutrition	165
11. Development: African Union Agenda 2063.....	176
12. Health: Mental Health	189
13. Trade: Internationally Recognized Environmental Standards	202
14. Labour and Employment: Work Conditions	220
15. Macroeconomics: Inclusive Growth.....	234
16. Regional Security: Ukraine	250

2. Terrorism: Combating Online Extremism

“We will counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.”

G7 Taormina Statement on the Fight Against Terrorism and Violent Extremism

Assessment

Member	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Canada		0	
France		0	
Germany			+1
Italy		0	
Japan		0	
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average		+0.50	

Background

While it is still a relatively new phenomenon, terrorist organizations’ use of the internet has become one of the most complex and effective facets of their recruitment efforts.⁹⁰ Al Qaeda is known to be the terrorist group that initially used social media most effectively and frequently. Brian Jenkins, the senior advisor to the RAND Corporation, suggests that “while almost all terrorist organizations have websites, al Qaeda [was] the first to fully exploit the internet ... It regards itself as a global movement and therefore depends on a global communications network to reach its perceived constituents... Its leaders view communications as 90 percent of the struggle.”⁹¹ Despite al Qaeda’s initial online prominence, the so-called Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) has completely revolutionized modern terrorism with its use of social media.⁹²

For ISIS and other terrorist organizations, propaganda serves a bifurcated purpose, and is not only used online. Terrorists’ presence, whether it be in the form of videos, magazines or photos, inspire like-minded individuals to convert to their ideology, but also incite fear and disgust in others.⁹³ Furthermore, terrorist groups can also use propaganda to threaten governments into action that is favourable to their aims. The challenges that face governments who seek to limit the impact of propaganda spread through the internet and social media often lie in the nature of social media. As platforms such as Twitter and Facebook are free to use, and anyone can easily create a new user if their previous account is banned or suspended, limiting the influence of terrorist groups on social

⁹⁰ How Terrorists Use the Internet, Operation 250 (No city) Access Date: 13 October 2017.

<https://www.operation250.org/how-terrorists-use-the-internet/>.

⁹¹ Is Al-Qaeda’s Internet Strategy Working?, Brian Michael Jenkins, Testimony Before the House Homeland Security Committee (Washington, D.C.) December 2011. Access Date: 13 October 2017.

<https://homeland.house.gov/files/Testimony%20Jenkins%20.pdf>.

⁹² How Terrorists Use the Internet, Operation 250 (No city) Access Date: 13 October 2017.

<https://www.operation250.org/how-terrorists-use-the-internet/>.

⁹³ How the Changing Media is Changing Terrorism, The Guardian (London) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/feb/25/how-changing-media-changing-terrorism>.

media is extremely difficult. A Berger and Morgan study found that, between September and December 2014, at least 46,000 Twitter accounts were used by ISIS supporters.⁹⁴

Despite the inherent difficulties in countering online terrorist propaganda, there have been instances in which both foreign governments and industries have attempted to diminish the scope of these actions. In 2012 for example, Twitter fundamentally altered its censorship policy to comply with the free-speech policies of certain major countries around the world.⁹⁵ What this meant was that, for example, in France and Germany, users would be banned from publishing tweets that contained pro-Nazi propaganda, as it is illegal in those countries.⁹⁶ Additionally, in the United States, after the beheading of American aid worker Peter Kassig in 2014, his family requested that the news media not display any segment of the video published by ISIS, in an attempt to limit the effects it had, in terms of both potential recruitment and in inciting terror, within the United States and abroad.⁹⁷ Notwithstanding these efforts, online terrorist presence still remains a major medium through which terrorist organizations disseminate their propaganda, recruit, and incite violence around the world.

At previous G7/8 summits, members have focused on the issue of terrorism in the physical world, that is, they have not often considered terrorism in terms of cyber or online terrorism or how the internet affects the dissemination of terrorist ideology and propaganda. At the 2016 Ise Shima Summit, G7 members discussed cyber-security broadly, but did not focus solely on the online aspect of terrorism. The 2017 Taormina Summit was the first time that the G7 members specifically mentioned online terrorism and discussed how to address it.⁹⁸

Commitment Features

At Taormina G7 leaders thus committed to “counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.”

“Support” refers to the action, or act of providing aid, assistance, or backing up an initiative, or entity.⁹⁹ “Counter” is to react to something with an opposing opinion or action, or to defend yourself against something.¹⁰⁰ “Propaganda” refers to information, ideas, opinions or images, often only giving one part of an argument, that are broadcast, published, or in some other way spread with the intention of influencing people’s opinions.¹⁰¹ “Extremism” is the holding of extreme political or religious views; fanaticism.¹⁰² “Radicalization” is the action or process of causing someone to adopt radical positions on political or social issues.¹⁰³ “Incitement” refers to the action of provoking

⁹⁴The ISIS Twitter Census Defining and Describing the Population of ISIS Supporters on Twitter, Brookings, (Washington, D.C.) 5 March 2015. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/the-isis-twitter-census-defining-and-describing-the-population-of-isis-supporters-on-twitter/>.

⁹⁵ Tweets Still Must Flow, Twitter, (San Francisco) 26 January 2012. Access Date: 13 October 2017. https://blog.twitter.com/official/en_us/a/2012/tweets-still-must-flow.html.

⁹⁶ Tweets Still Must Flow, Twitter, (San Francisco) 26 January 2012. Access Date: 13 October 2017. https://blog.twitter.com/official/en_us/a/2012/tweets-still-must-flow.html.

⁹⁷ Peter Kassig’s Powerful Silence Before ISIS Beheaded Him, Time, (New York) 17 November 2014. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <http://time.com/3589350/peter-kassigs-powerful-silence-before-isis-beheaded-him/>.

⁹⁸ 2016 Ise-Shima Final Compliance Report, University of Toronto G7 Research Group (Toronto) 25 May 2017. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <http://www.g8.utoronto.ca/evaluations/2016compliance-final/2016-g7-compliance-final.pdf>.

⁹⁹ Support, Compliance Coding Manual (Toronto) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁰⁰ Counter, Cambridge English Dictionary Online (Cambridge) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁰¹ Propaganda, Cambridge English Dictionary Online (Cambridge) 2017. Access Date: 13 October 2017.

¹⁰² Extremism, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁰³ Radicalization, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

unlawful behavior or urging someone to behave unlawfully.¹⁰⁴ Lastly, “violence” is behavior involving physical force intended to hurt, damage, or kill someone or something.¹⁰⁵

The commitment made by the G7 members at the 2017 Taormina Summit is as follows: 1) to combat the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations; 2) to prevent the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the internet; and 3) to avoid the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers.

Examples of what could be done to achieve such ends are as follows:

1. To combat the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations, the G7 member could:
 1. Work towards tackling the global issues such as poverty, illiteracy and poor education that provide terrorist organizations a base from which they can disseminate their propaganda, in physical form or online.¹⁰⁶
1. To prevent the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the internet, a G7 member could:
 - a) Present a positive counter-narrative to targeted groups, and suggest that those who seek to subvert and recruit do so out of malice.¹⁰⁷
2. To avoid the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers, a G7 member could:
 - a) Promote, at the governmental level, the “de-glamorizing” of terrorist organizations and espouse the experiences of significant muslim figures who speak out against the activities of terrorist organizations.¹⁰⁸

In terms of evaluating G7 members and their compliance to this commitment, they should be judged based on their ability to successfully limit the impacts of terrorist propaganda, and activity, online in relation to their tangible, real-world ramifications. As such, for full compliance the G7 member must take action to 1) counter terrorist propaganda that supports terrorism and violent extremism; 2) counter terrorist propaganda supporting online recruitment; and 3) counter terrorist propaganda supporting radicalization and incitement to violence. Partial compliance results if the G7 member has taken action in only one or two of the three areas, and non-compliance results if no action is taken.

Scoring Guidelines

Score	Description
-1	Member does not apply the necessary means to counter the proliferation of terrorist propaganda, online terrorist recruitment, or the radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.

¹⁰⁴ Incitement, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁰⁵ Violence, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁰⁶ A Strategy for Countering Terrorist Propaganda in the Digital Age, U.S. Department of State (Sydney, Australia) 12 June 2015. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁰⁷ A Strategy for Countering Terrorist Propaganda in the Digital Age, U.S. Department of State (Sydney, Australia) 12 June 2015. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁰⁸ A Strategy for Countering Terrorist Propaganda in the Digital Age, U.S. Department of State (Sydney, Australia) 12 June 2015. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

0	Member recognizes the need to limit the proliferation of terrorism through the outlined avenues, however, only counters one OR two of the above facets of online terrorism.
+1	Member applies the necessary means to counter the proliferation of terrorist propaganda, online terrorist recruitment, and the radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.

Lead Analyst: Nicholas Allard

Canada: 0

Canada has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 26 June 2017, the Interior Ministers and Attorney Generals of Canada, Australia, New Zealand, the United States, and the United Kingdom met at a five ministerial conference in Ottawa.¹⁰⁹ The meeting's resulting joint communiqué included pledges from the participating Ministers to commit to a series of practices to combat extremist groups. As part of this strategy were tactics that included engagement with key communication service providers, and utilizing traditional and social media to disrupt and counteract terrorist messaging.¹¹⁰

On 29 June 2017, Canadian Defence Minister Harjit S. Sajjan and Foreign Affairs Minister Chrystia Freeland announced a renewal of Canada's commitment to the Global Coalition Against Daesh until 31 March 2019.¹¹¹ Among other tasks, the Global Coalition's mandate includes identifying and countering Daesh propaganda in order to delegitimize the terrorist organization's recruitment efforts.¹¹²

On 6 July 2017, the Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence opened calls for proposals for funding from the Centre's newly created Community Resilience Fund.¹¹³ According to Public Safety Canada, the Community Resilience Fund helps fund organizations seeking to enact programs and research to address radicalization of Canadians.¹¹⁴ The Community Resilience Fund was allocated an initial CAD 2,400,000 to fund existing and new projects during the 2017-2018 period, with another CAD 4,400,000 pledged for 2018-2019, and CAD 7,000,000 each year for 2019-2020 and beyond.¹¹⁵

¹⁰⁹ Five Country Ministerial 2017: Joint Communiqué, Public Safety Canada (Ottawa) 28 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrscs/pblctns/fv-cntry-mnstrl-2017/index-en.aspx>.

¹¹⁰ Five Country Ministerial 2017: Joint Communiqué, Public Safety Canada (Ottawa) 28 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrscs/pblctns/fv-cntry-mnstrl-2017/index-en.aspx>.

¹¹¹ Canada Renews Contribution to the Global Coalition against Daesh, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 29 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/news/2017/06/canada_renews_contributiontotheglobalcoalitionagainstdaesh.html.

¹¹² Countering Daesh's Propaganda, Global Coalition Against Daesh 3 February 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <http://theglobalcoalition.org/en/countering-daeshs-propaganda/?lang=en>.

¹¹³ New Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence supports local efforts, CISION (Ottawa) 26 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <http://www.newswire.ca/news-releases/new-canada-centre-for-community-engagement-and-prevention-of-violence-supports-local-efforts-630824813.html>.

¹¹⁴ Community Resilience Fund, Public Safety Canada (Ottawa) 30 October 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/bt/cc/fnd-en.aspx>.

¹¹⁵ Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence funds project to combat hate, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 12 September 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.canada.ca/en/public-safety-canada/news/2017/09/canada_centre_forcommunityengagementandpreventionofviolencefunds.html.

On 12 September 2017, Member of Parliament Marc Miller announced on behalf of Public Safety Canada an investment from the Community Resilience Fund to support Project SOMEONE. Project SOMEONE (Social Media Education Every Day) is an online portal, designed to combat hate and radicalization towards violence. The funding for Project SOMEONE is intended to facilitate a better understanding of the production, usage, and online perception of hate speech.¹¹⁶

Canada has recognized the need to counter propaganda that supports terrorism, terrorist online recruitment, and radicalization and incitement to violence. However, Canada has only taken concrete action to address the latter two issues.

Thus, Canada receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Geordie Jeakins

France: 0

France has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 26 August 2017, the French Minister for Europe and Foreign Affairs Jean-Yves Le Drian and Minister for the Armed Forces Florence Parly have confirmed the provision of EUR 430 million to the Government of Iraq to help post-conflict recovery and reconstruction through humanitarian aid and stabilization efforts with the overall aim to overcome terrorism.¹¹⁷ France also contributed to this effort through its support for UN agencies.¹¹⁸

On 2 August 2017, France contributed USD 980,600 to the United Nations Development Programme's Iraq Crisis Response and Resilience Programme (ICRRP) to promote recovery and resilience-building in areas previously occupied by terrorist groups such as the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL).¹¹⁹

On 13 June 2017, French President Emmanuel Macron and British Prime Minister Theresa May agreed to a joint initiative to tackle online terrorist and criminal activity.¹²⁰ The action plan highlights four priorities: improve online illegal content removal, support civil society actors' counter-narratives, ensure access to data during investigations and develop access to digital evidence for cross-border law enforcement.¹²¹ Regarding access to data during investigations, France and the United Kingdom

¹¹⁶ Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence funds project to combat hate, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 12 September 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.canada.ca/en/public-safety-canada/news/2017/09/canada_centre_forcommunityengagementandpreventionofviolencefunds.html.

¹¹⁷ L'après-daech : comment la France s'engage, Service d'information du Gouvernement (Paris) October 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <http://www.stop-djihadisme.gouv.fr/lutte-contre-terrorisme-radicalisation/laction-france-a-linternational/lapres-daech-comment-france>.

¹¹⁸ L'après-daech : comment la France s'engage, Service d'information du Gouvernement (Paris) October 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <http://www.stop-djihadisme.gouv.fr/lutte-contre-terrorisme-radicalisation/laction-france-a-linternational/lapres-daech-comment-france>

¹¹⁹ France contributes US\$980,600 to resilience in Iraq, United Nations Development Programme Iraq (Baghdad) 2 August 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <http://www.iq.undp.org/content/iraq/en/home/presscenter/pressreleases/2017/08/02/france-contributes-us-980-600-to-resilience-in-iraq-.html>

¹²⁰ French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

¹²¹ French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

agreed to retain traffic and location data, share expertise on the identification of subscription holders and share strategies on accessing encrypted content.¹²² The aforementioned action plan further mentions other steps, such as calling for an early meeting of G7 interior ministers to broaden its support.¹²³

On 20 September 2017 during the 72nd United Nations General Assembly in New York, President Emmanuel Macron reaffirmed France's commitment to counter propaganda through the rapid detection and removal of propaganda content on the Internet and support civil society discourse as an essential part of these counter-propaganda efforts.¹²⁴

France has implemented new measures to combat online extremism during the compliance period. It has taken concerted efforts to facilitate the fight against the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations as well as facilitate the prevention of the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the Internet. However, France did not take substantive actions to avoid and decrease the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers.

Thus, France receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Cecile Amiot

Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 7 July 2017, the first day of the Hamburg G20 Summit, German Chancellor Angela Merkel stressed that terrorism poses a severe threat to everyone, and has damaging implications on free trade and economic growth.¹²⁵ She also emphasized the importance to share information more effectively as this applies to the work of Interpol, and strengthening the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) to cap terrorists' sources of funding more effectively.¹²⁶ Merkel made it clear that the German government is making a concentrated effort to open discussion surrounding the internet and terrorism, and has highlighted the need for prompt removal of terrorist propaganda by online media and social networks.¹²⁷

On 14 June 2017, Germany's Family and Interior Ministries have announced a new national action plan against racism with a EUR 100 million contribution being specifically targeted at preventing

¹²² French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

¹²³ French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

¹²⁴ Fight against terrorism/cyber security/digital technology — Speech by M. Emmanuel Macron, President of the Republic — 72nd United Nations General Assembly, Permanent mission of France to the United Nations in New York (New York) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://onu.delegfrance.org/Fight-against-terrorism-it-s-a-challenge-we-share>.

¹²⁵ G20 — First Day of the Summit, German Federal Government (Berlin) 7 July 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2017/07_en/2017-07-07-gipfel-freitag_en.html?nn=709674.

¹²⁶ G20 — First Day of the Summit, German Federal Government (Berlin) 7 July 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2017/07_en/2017-07-07-gipfel-freitag_en.html?nn=709674.

¹²⁷ G20 — First Day of the Summit, German Federal Government (Berlin) 7 July 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2017/07_en/2017-07-07-gipfel-freitag_en.html?nn=709674.

Islamist radicalization.¹²⁸ Funds are to be utilized in a number of ways including allocation to support mosque communities, while also investing in expanding the prevention of radicalization online.¹²⁹

On 30 June 2017, German lawmakers have approved a controversial law that would impose high fines on social media companies such as Facebook, Twitter, or YouTube for failing to delete explicitly hateful and criminal speech promptly within 24 hours of it being posted.¹³⁰

On 24 August 2017, an amendment was made to the German Criminal Code of Procedure to expand the capacities of German law enforcement agencies to search online digital content and surveil telecommunications networks by exploiting software vulnerabilities without the consent or awareness of the subject.¹³¹

On 25 August 2017, Germany successfully banned a left-wing extremist online platform it claimed to incite and fuel violent protests at the G20 summit in Hamburg in July. Interior Minister Thomas de Maizière said the website was shut down as well as its networks email, social media accounts, and its license to operate as an organization were cancelled for displaying hate and encouraging indecent behaviours.¹³²

Germany has made sufficient efforts to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, and radicalization and incitement to violence since its attendance at the Taormina Summit in May 2017. Its statements of collaboration with international partners, funding efforts for preventing radicalization, pressuring of social network companies to remove online content, and shutting down of domestic networks has demonstrated a willingness to comply.

Thus, Germany receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Robert Hiff

Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 28 July 2017, Italy's executive branch, the Council of Ministers, chaired by Prime Minister Paolo Gentiloni, issued press release no. 40 which outlined the approval of a regulation for the protection of personal data. This prohibits the collection of data on persons on the basis of their racial or ethnic

¹²⁸ Germany presents racism action plan, invests millions into preventing extremism, Deutsche Welle (Bonne) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.dw.com/en/germany-presents-racism-action-plan-invests-millions-into-preventing-extremism/a-39248515>.

¹²⁹ Germany presents racism action plan, invests millions into preventing extremism, Deutsche Welle (Bonn) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.dw.com/en/germany-presents-racism-action-plan-invests-millions-into-preventing-extremism/a-39248515>.

¹³⁰ Bundestag passes law to fine social media companies for not deleting hate speech, Deutsche Welle News. 30 June 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.dw.com/en/bundestag-passes-law-to-fine-social-media-companies-for-not-deleting-hate-speech/a-39486694>.

¹³¹ Germany: Expanded Telecommunications Surveillance and Online Search Powers, Library of Congress (Washington, DC) 7 September 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <http://www.loc.gov/law/foreign-news/article/germany-expanded-telecommunications-surveillance-and-online-search-powers/>.

¹³² Germany, In a First, Shuts Down Left-Wing Extremist Website, New York Times (New York) 25 August 2017. Access Date: 20 November 2017. <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/08/25/world/europe/germany-bans-far-left-antifa-website.html>.

origin, religious beliefs, etc., with the significant exception being that personal data can be used in the context of preventing or repressing organized crime, including terrorism.¹³³

On 20 September 2017, Prime Minister Paolo Gentiloni delivered a speech at the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA). In the speech, he reaffirmed Italy's G7 commitment to counter online recruitment by terrorists by pursuing initiatives to counter their use of the internet and social media.¹³⁴

On 20 September 2017, Gentiloni along with British Prime Minister Theresa May and French President Emmanuel Macron issued a joint statement in a side-event at the UNGA, which reiterated that Italy is resolved to prevent the misuse of the internet by terrorist groups and individual extremists.¹³⁵ Along with the other two G7 members, Italy clarified its commitment to "working together to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content online and use of the Internet by terrorists to radicalize, recruit, inspire or incite."¹³⁶ However, Gentiloni did not explicitly outline any concrete measures by Italy to counter propaganda supporting terrorism. Instead, through its joint statement with the UK and France, Italy only recognized the efforts of Facebook, Microsoft, Twitter and YouTube (through the Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism) to prevent terrorists from exploiting the internet to spread terrorism and violent propaganda.¹³⁷

On 2 November 2017, as per press release no. 55 by the Council of Ministers, new provisions concerning the interception of conversations or communications were introduced under Article 1 of the Criminal Code of Crime. This new provision outlines the contexts under which these interceptions can occur, with the most serious crimes, including terrorism, being the case.¹³⁸

Italy has made effective contributions towards countering online recruitment by extremists and countering the radicalization and incitement to violence. However, while it has recognized their importance and encouraged measures to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, Italy has not taken tangible measures to effectively counter these issues.

Thus, Italy receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Nicolas Di Marco

¹³³ Press Release of the Council of Ministers no. 40, Italian Government Presidency of the Ministers (Rome) 28 July 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.governo.it/articolo/comunicato-stampa-del-consiglio-dei-ministri-n-40/7891>.

¹³⁴ 72nd General Assembly of the United Nations. Statement by His Excellency, The President of the Council of Ministers, The Honourable Paolo Gentiloni, (New York) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 20 November 2017. https://gadebate.un.org/sites/default/files/gastatements/72/it_en.pdf.

¹³⁵ Statement by the United Kingdom, France and Italy at the High Level Meeting on the Prevention of Terrorists' Use of the Internet, New York, Presidency of the Republic (Paris) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. <http://www.elysee.fr/communiqués-de-presse/article/declaration-du-royaume-uni-de-la-france-et-de-l-italie-lors-de-la-reunion-de-haut-niveau-sur-la-prevention-de-l-utilisation-d-internet-par-les-terroristes-new-york-le-20-septembre-2017/>.

¹³⁶ Fight Against Terrorism: It's a Challenge We Share, Permanent Mission of France to the United Nations in New York (New York) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <https://onu.delegfrance.org/Fight-against-terrorism-it-s-a-challenge-we-share>.

¹³⁷ France, UK and Italy Cooperate to Fight Terrorism Online, Embassy of France in Washington, D.C. (Washington D.C.) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <https://franceintheus.org/spip.php?article8330>.

¹³⁸ Press Release of the Council of Ministers no. 55, Italian Government Presidency of the Ministers (Rome) 2 November 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.governo.it/articolo/comunicato-stampa-del-consiglio-dei-ministri-n-55/8373>.

Japan: 0

Japan has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 20 September 2017, Taro Kono, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Japan, gave a statement at the Eight Global Counterterrorism Forum Ministerial Plenary Meeting in New York City. There, he stated, “Effective counter-terrorism requires mid- to long-term support to address the root-causes of terrorism in addition to immediate assistance.”¹³⁹ Kono stated that Japan would assist developing countries prone to terrorism on strengthening border security and development solutions, such as poverty alleviation and education support, and conduct further research on how to counter violent extremism.¹⁴⁰

On 20 October 2017, Hachiro Okonogi, Chairperson of the National Public Safety Commission of Japan, signed on to a joint communiqué with other interior ministers at the G7 Interior Ministers’ Meeting in Ischia, Italy, countering online threats of terrorism.¹⁴¹ The document reads, “Da’esh, al-Qa’ida, and other terrorist and violent extremist organizations continue to exploit the Internet to spread propaganda, recruit operatives, incite violence and inspire attacks.”¹⁴² The ministers encouraged both the private sector and civil society to “develop counter-narratives against [online] terrorist propaganda.”¹⁴³

Japan recognizes the need to limit the proliferation of terrorism, and has passed measures to counter the preparation of these acts. However, the member has not explicitly applied means to oppose online terrorist recruitment or the online radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.

Thus, Japan receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Ilya Bañares

United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 20 September 2017, at a speech to United Nations General Assembly, Prime Minister Theresa May outlined the following: “While this event and the Global Forum are about preventing terrorist propaganda from spreading online and radicalising our citizens, we must also work together to tackle

¹³⁹ Statement by H.E. Mr. Taro Kono, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Japan, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan (Tokyo) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/files/000291685.pdf>.

¹⁴⁰ Statement by H.E. Mr. Taro Kono, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Japan, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan (Tokyo) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/files/000291685.pdf>.

¹⁴¹ Fight against terrorism and violent extremism: turning commitments into action, G7 Interior Ministers’ Meeting (Ischia) 20 October 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.g7italy.it/sites/default/files/documents/Joint%20Communiqué.pdf>.

¹⁴² Fight against terrorism and violent extremism: turning commitments into action, G7 Interior Ministers’ Meeting (Ischia) 20 October 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.g7italy.it/sites/default/files/documents/Joint%20Communiqué.pdf>.

¹⁴³ Fight against terrorism and violent extremism: turning commitments into action, G7 Interior Ministers’ Meeting (Ischia) 20 October 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.g7italy.it/sites/default/files/documents/Joint%20Communiqué.pdf>.

the abuse of encrypted messaging apps to plan, direct and coordinate terrorist attacks.” That same day, Britain, France, and Italy released a joint statement pertaining to online radicalization, placing specific emphasis on a two-hour designation. Noting that disseminators of terrorist propaganda release such information in rapid and multilateral fashions, the leaders called for “algorithmic confinement”:¹⁴⁴ “Recognising this, we have set the challenge to industry, working collaboratively through the Forum, to develop solutions to remove material within 1-2 hours of upload, with the wider objective of preventing such material from being uploaded in the first place.”¹⁴⁵ This 1-2 hour interval¹⁴⁶ is believed to be when content attracts the widest audiences, and is diffused. Remedying this involves working with social media and tech platforms, developing methods to ensure that individuals prone to radical inclinations will not encounter content amplifying these. Moreover, the government seeks to drive this across the “25 sites most commonly used by terrorists, and extending the hash sharing database to as many companies as possible in order to support efforts to identify and remove new and legacy material.”¹⁴⁷ The statement also pledges to prevent “previously identified terrorist material”¹⁴⁸ from being recycled on online forums, in the case of preemptive measures failing to locate and remove it. These cross-platform, public-private proposals have yet to take effect.

On 21 September 2017, the United Kingdom and the Global Solutions Exchange co-hosted an event on Innovations in Civil Society and other Locally Led Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Build Social Cohesion and Resilience.¹⁴⁹ The event focused on collaborating to build national action plans (NAPs) to prevent violent extremism (PVE) by creating a more inclusive society.

On 3 October 2017, the British government proposed tangible, legislative measures to target repeated viewers of terrorist content. A Home Office memorandum outlined the framework: “The proposed changes will strengthen the existing offence of possessing information likely to be useful to a terrorist (Section 58 Terrorism Act 2000) so that it applies to material that is viewed repeatedly or streamed online.”¹⁵⁰ A sentence of up to 15 years would be considered, and attributing it to the

¹⁴⁴ Statement by the UK, France and Italy on the leaders' meeting on preventing terrorist use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 17 September 21. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/statement-by-the-uk-france-and-italy-on-the-leaders-meeting-on-preventing-terrorist-use-of-the-internet>.

¹⁴⁵ Statement by the UK, France and Italy on the leaders' meeting on preventing terrorist use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 21 September 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/statement-by-the-uk-france-and-italy-on-the-leaders-meeting-on-preventing-terrorist-use-of-the-internet>.

¹⁴⁶ Prime Minister calls for automatic blocking of terrorist content, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 19 September 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/prime-minister-calls-for-automatic-blocking-of-terrorist-content>.

¹⁴⁷ Statement by the UK, France and Italy on the leaders' meeting on preventing terrorist use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 21 September 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/statement-by-the-uk-france-and-italy-on-the-leaders-meeting-on-preventing-terrorist-use-of-the-internet>.

¹⁴⁸ Statement by the UK, France and Italy on the leaders' meeting on preventing terrorist use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 21 September 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/statement-by-the-uk-france-and-italy-on-the-leaders-meeting-on-preventing-terrorist-use-of-the-internet>.

¹⁴⁹ Innovations in Civil Society and other Locally Led Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Build Social Cohesion and Resilience, Global Solutions Exchange (New York), 21 September 2018. Access Date: 8 April 2018. <http://www.gsxpve.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/UNGA-GSX-Concept-Note-NAP-Side-Event.pdf>

¹⁵⁰ Law tightened to target terrorists' use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 3 October 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/law-tightened-to-target-terrorists-use-of-the-internet>.

forementioned offence expands on pre-existing applications; “currently the power only applies to online material which has been downloaded and stored on the offender’s computer, is saved on a separate device or printed off as a hard copy.”¹⁵¹ Furthermore, the publishing of any information pertaining to public service officials, in civilian or military capacities, to facilitate acts of terrorism, is equally punishable by the newly tabled maximum penalty.

In October 2017, the UK Department for Digital Culture, Media and Sports (DCMS) published the Internet Safety Strategy green paper. Although this green paper acknowledges that online extremism and terrorist use of the internet are issues that fall outside the scope of this strategy, there is a link through the strategy working to make the internet a safer and more positively narrated space.¹⁵²

The ratification of the Right Honourable Rudd’s legislation, and institutionalization of the British, French, and Italian coalition’s guidelines are highly constructive. The government’s broad initiatives with tech multinationals are still in progress, but the UK has demonstrated significant effort to collaborate with international, multinational and civil society stakeholders to share best practices and put forward a cohesive front against online terrorism.

Thus, the United Kingdom receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Anders Bretsen

United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 11 July 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS Working Groups on Counter Finance, Foreign Terrorist Fighters, Stabilization Support and Communications met separately. The discussions focused on the campaign and how to increasingly restrain ISIS.¹⁵³

On 12 July, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy met with the rest of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS to discuss the means by which to increase efforts to defeat ISIS in Iraq and Syria. Also discussed was how to impact the effect on its branches, affiliates and networks throughout the world.¹⁵⁴

On 13 July, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS Small Group met to discuss how to defeat ISIS by strengthening the progress in Mosul and

¹⁵¹ Law tightened to target terrorists' use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 3 October 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/law-tightened-to-target-terrorists-use-of-the-internet>.

¹⁵² Internet safety strategy green paper, Government of the United Kingdom (London) October 2017. Access Date: 8 April 2019. https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/650949/Internet_Safety_Strategy_green_paper.pdf

¹⁵³ Meeting of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS, U.S. State Department (Washington D.C.) 5 July 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/07/272362.htm>.

¹⁵⁴ Meeting of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS, U.S. State Department (Washington D.C.) 5 July 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/07/272362.htm>.

Raqqa. A special meeting was also held for agents from some African countries, the African Union, and the Multinational Joint Task force on ISIS in the Lake Chad Basin region.¹⁵⁵

From 29 August to 4 September, 2017, the United States Ambassador-at-Large for Counterterrorism, Nathan A. Sales, travelled to Brussels, London and Paris. There he discussed continuing joint efforts to fight against the terrorism threat in Europe and globally.¹⁵⁶

On 20 September, 2017, the United States Global Terrorism Forum published a fact sheet on how to recognize “civilian counter terrorism needs, mobilize the necessary expertise and resources to support capacity building and enhance global counterterrorism cooperation.”¹⁵⁷

On 20-21 September, 2017, the United States government partnered with Peru to hold a two-day workshop in Lima, Peru. This workshop was on how to use law enforcement and counterterrorism finance tools to combat Hezbollah’s activities.¹⁵⁸

On 3 October, 2017, the United States Acting Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for Political-Military Affairs Michael Miller and Bangladesh Director General for the Americas at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Abida Islam chaired the Sixth U.S.-Bangladesh Bilateral Security Dialogue at the U.S. Department of State in Washington DC. Discussions focused on expanding partnerships in counterterrorism, among other issues.¹⁵⁹

On 4 October, 2017, the United States Department of State held the U.S.-China Law Enforcement and Cybersecurity Dialogue in Washington DC. The Dialogue discussed important areas of the U.S.-China relationship on counterterrorism, among other issues.¹⁶⁰

On 30 October, 2017, the United States government pledged up to USD 60 million to support the G5 Sahel Joint Forces counter terrorism efforts. It is to support the United States regional partners who are fighting to ensure security and stability against ISIS, affiliated groups and other terrorist networks.¹⁶¹

On 8 November, 2017, the United States and Qatari officials met in Washington D.C. for the first U.S.-Qatari counter terrorism dialogue. The delegations reviewed Qatar’s positive progress in implementing the U.S.-Qatar counterterrorism Memorandum of Understanding signed in Doha on 11 July.¹⁶²

¹⁵⁵ Meeting of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS, U.S. State Department (Washington D.C.) 5 July 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/07/272362.htm>.

¹⁵⁶ Ambassador-at-Large for Counterterrorism Nathan A. Sales to Travel to Europe, U.S. State Department 29 August 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/08/273691.htm>.

¹⁵⁷ Global Counterterrorism Forum Deliverables Fact Sheet, U.S. State Department 20 September 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/09/274303.htm>

¹⁵⁸ U.S.-Peru Workshop on Countering Hizballah’s Terrorist and Criminal Activities, U.S. State Department 22 September 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/09/274379.htm>

¹⁵⁹ U.S.-Bangladesh Bilateral Security Dialogue, U.S. State Department 3 October 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/10/274581.htm>

¹⁶⁰ U.S.-China Law Enforcement and Cybersecurity Dialogue, U.S State Department 3 October 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/10/274590.htm>

¹⁶¹ United States Pledging up to \$60 Million in New Support for Security Assistance in the Sahel Region, U.S State Department 30 October 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/secretary/remarks/2017/10/275175.htm>

¹⁶² First U.S.-Qatar Counterterrorism Dialogue, U.S State Department 8 November 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/11/275409.htm>

On 15 November, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS met with key members of the Defeat ISIS Coalition in Amman, Jordan. At the meeting the Coalition partners discussed the next steps to ensure ISIS is dealt an enduring defeat in Iraq and Syria and ways to accelerate their collective approach to defeat ISIS's global ambitions.¹⁶³

On 15-16 November, 2017, the United States government and the Kingdom of Morocco launched a global initiative to address homegrown terrorism. To address homegrown terrorism, the initiative's launch brought together over 70 government officials, law enforcement officers, academics, and non-governmental representatives from 25 countries.¹⁶⁴

The United States has clearly recognized the need to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

Thus, the United States receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sonja Dobson

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied to its commitment to countering propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 19 July 2017, the European Commission reported on the actions taken on countering hybrid threats, as were implemented in the 2016 Joint Framework.¹⁶⁵ Hybrid threats combine both conventional and unconventional methods such as cyber-attacks and media manipulation.¹⁶⁶ This report entailed a description of the Communication Task Forces that had been established between "Eastern and Southern Neighbourhoods,"¹⁶⁷ the Task Force on Cyber-Security, cooperation with third countries, and cooperation between the EU and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization.¹⁶⁸ The European Union used this report to announce the development of an operational protocol that

¹⁶³ Meeting of the Small Group of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS in Jordan, U.S. State Department 9 November 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/11/275441.htm>

¹⁶⁴ Initiative to Address Homegrown Terrorism Launch Event Held in Valletta, Malta, U.S State Department 16 November 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/11/275689.htm>

¹⁶⁵ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe's Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

¹⁶⁶ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe's Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

¹⁶⁷ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe's Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

¹⁶⁸ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe's Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

would outline coordination between intelligence collection and analysis regarding online terrorism and resilience in security.¹⁶⁹

On 14 September 2017, the European Union adopted a programme worth EUR17.5 million to address terrorist threats in the Middle East and North Africa. This three-year programme is aimed to address the drivers and threats from terrorism in these regions to build resilience against terrorism and radicalization leading to violent extremism.¹⁷⁰ Federica Mogherini, the High Representative and Vice-President of the European Commission, stated that cooperation on counterterrorism would be an increased priority within Europe and with its partners. This programme will strengthen the capacity of state actors in countering terrorism, and will also focus on youth and communities in addressing factors that lead to vulnerability to violent extremism and radicalization.¹⁷¹

On 28 September 2017, President Jean-Claude Juncker accompanied his State of the Union speech (which was held on 13 September 2017) with a presentation of guidelines and principles for online platforms. This new program would increase the “proactive prevention, detection, and prompt removal of illegal content inciting hatred, violence, and terrorism online.”¹⁷² This weeding out of illegal content would include a more streamlined process for detection and notification by trusted flaggers and the promotion of investment in automatic detection technologies, effective removal and transparency reports, as well as the prevention of re-appearance and repeated uploading of this illegal content.¹⁷³ President Juncker stated that the next steps, which are to be completed by May 2018, are to monitor progress of online platforms and to later assess whether additional measures are necessary, including possible legislative measures.¹⁷⁴

On 18 October 2017, Commissioner Julian King spoke at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror.”¹⁷⁵ In his speech, King addressed the proliferation of radicalization and proliferation of terrorist propaganda, and called on the importance of closing the spaces in which terrorism operates and closing loopholes in terms of recruitment and

¹⁶⁹ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe’s Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

¹⁷⁰ European Union Steps Up Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Counter-Terrorism in the Middle East and North Africa, European Commission (Brussels) 14 September 2017. Access Date: 17 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3225_en.htm.

¹⁷¹ European Union Steps Up Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Counter-Terrorism in the Middle East and North Africa, European Commission (Brussels) 14 September 2017. Access Date: 17 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3225_en.htm.

¹⁷² Security Union: Commission Steps Up Efforts to Tackle Illegal Content Online, European Commission (Brussels) 28 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3493_en.htm.

¹⁷³ Security Union: Commission Steps Up Efforts to Tackle Illegal Content Online, European Commission (Brussels) 28 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3493_en.htm.

¹⁷⁴ Security Union: Commission Steps Up Efforts to Tackle Illegal Content Online, European Commission (Brussels) 28 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3493_en.htm.

¹⁷⁵ Commissioner King’s Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror”, (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en.

means.¹⁷⁶ He explicitly stated that over 38,000 pieces of content were referred by the Europe internet referral unit, and 85% were removed.¹⁷⁷ This speech on 18 October 2017 reiterated the success of the European Union’s Radicalization Awareness Network, which connects individuals involved in preventing radicalization and violent extremism throughout Europe.¹⁷⁸ While this project is ongoing, Commissioner King spoke of success in its working groups such as the Communications and Narratives working group, which acts to deliver on-and-offline communication that counters extremist propaganda, the Education working group, which brings together first-line education practitioners to empower them in countering radicalization, as well as the Health and Social Care working group, which interprets signs of radicalization and helps those at risk of incitement to violence.¹⁷⁹

On 27 November 2017, EU Commissioner Dimitris Avramopoulos announced at the Eighth Annual Bosphorus Summit, held in Istanbul, Turkey, that the EU Internet Forum had voluntarily partnered with the internet industry, and has regulated and seen to 95% of terrorist content being automatically removed by companies.¹⁸⁰ Avramopoulos addressed the hope for more companies to join this collaboration, and spoke of the success of the Radicalisation Awareness Network’s reach to countries outside of Europe.¹⁸¹

The European Union has made effective contributions to countering propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

Thus, the European Union receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Courtney Amanda Wong

¹⁷⁶ Commissioner King’s Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror”, (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en.

¹⁷⁷ Commissioner King’s Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror” (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en

¹⁷⁸ Commissioner King’s Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror” (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en.

¹⁷⁹ RAN Working Groups (Brussels) 25 November 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/networks/radicalisation_awareness_network/about-ran_en.

¹⁸⁰ Remarks by Commissioner Dimitris Avramopoulos at the 8th Bosphorus Summit, European Commission (Brussels) 27 November 2017. Access Date: 8 January 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/avramopoulos/announcements/remarks-commissioner-dimitris-avramopoulos-8th-bosphorus-summit_en

¹⁸¹ Remarks by Commissioner Dimitris Avramopoulos at the 8th Bosphorus Summit, European Commission (Brussels) 27 November 2017. Access Date: 8 January 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/avramopoulos/announcements/remarks-commissioner-dimitris-avramopoulos-8th-bosphorus-summit_en
