The G7 Research Group at the Munk School of Global Affairs at Trinity College in the University of Toronto presents the

2017 Taormina G7 Final Compliance Report
27 May 2017 to 25 May 2018

Prepared by
Katrina Bland, Andrew Liu and Sarah Mariani
G7 Research Group, University of Toronto
4 June 2018
www.g7.utoronto.ca
g7@utoronto.ca
@g7_rg

“We have meanwhile set up a process and there are also independent institutions monitoring which objectives of our G7 meetings we actually achieve. When it comes to these goals we have a compliance rate of about 80%, according to the University of Toronto. Germany, with its 87%, comes off pretty well. That means that next year too, under the Japanese G7 presidency, we are going to check where we stand in comparison to what we have discussed with each other now. So a lot of what we have resolved to do here together is something that we are going to have to work very hard at over the next few months. But I think that it has become apparent that we, as the G7, want to assume responsibility far beyond the prosperity in our own countries. That's why today's outreach meetings, that is the meetings with our guests, were also of great importance.”

Chancellor Angela Merkel, Schloss Elmau, 8 June 2015

G7 summits are a moment for people to judge whether aspirational intent is met by concrete commitments. The G7 Research Group provides a report card on the implementation of G7 and G20 commitments. It is a good moment for the public to interact with leaders and say, you took a leadership position on these issues – a year later, or three years later, what have you accomplished?

Achim Steiner, Administrator, United Nations Development Programme, in G7 Canada: The 2018 Charlevoix Summit
## Contents

Preface ................................................................................................................. 3
Research Team ...................................................................................................... 4
- Lead Analysts ................................................................................................. 4
- Compliance Analysts and Editors ................................................................. 4
Executive Summary ......................................................................................... 6
- The Final Compliance Score .......................................................................... 6
- Compliance by Member .................................................................................. 6
- Compliance by Commitment ......................................................................... 6
- The Compliance Gap Between Members ....................................................... 6
Future Research and Reports .......................................................................... 6
- Table A: 2017 Priority Commitments Selected for Assessment* ................. 7
- Table B: 2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Scores .............................. 9
- Table C: 2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Scores by Country .......... 10
- Table D: 2017 G7 Taormina Final Compliance Scores by Commitment ....... 11

1. Terrorism: Aviation and Border Security ...................................................... 12
2. Terrorism: Combating Online Extremism .................................................. 31
3. Terrorism: Syria .......................................................................................... 50
4. Non-proliferation: Nuclear Weapons and Disarmament ......................... 68
5. Trade: Protectionism and Trade Practices .................................................. 93
6. Trade: Internationally Recognized Environmental Standards ................. 113
7. Gender: Human Trafficking and Exploitation ............................................ 131
8. Gender: Encouraging Women in the Private Sector ................................. 147
9. Gender: Intersecting Inequalities .............................................................. 162
10. Migration: Addressing the Drivers of Migration ........................................ 174
11. Climate Change: Energy and Clean Technology ........................................ 206
12. Climate Change: Paris Agreement ............................................................ 223
13. Food and Agriculture: Food Security and Nutrition ............................... 258
15. Health: Mental Health ............................................................................... 285
16. Labour and Employment: Work Conditions ........................................... 301
17. Macroeconomics: Inclusive Growth ......................................................... 318
18. Regional Security: Ukraine ....................................................................... 336
19. Information and Communication Technology ........................................... 352
2. Terrorism: Combating Online Extremism

“We will counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.”

**G7 Taormina Statement on the Fight Against Terrorism and Violent Extremism**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>No Compliance</th>
<th>Partial Compliance</th>
<th>Full Compliance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Union</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+0.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Background**

While it is still a relatively new phenomenon, terrorist organizations’ use of the internet has become one of the most complex and effective facets of their recruitment efforts.\(^{146}\) Al Qaeda is known to be the terrorist group that initially used social media most effectively and frequently. Brian Jenkins, the senior advisor to the RAND Corporation, suggests that “while almost all terrorist organizations have websites, al Qaeda [was] the first to fully exploit the internet … It regards itself as a global movement and therefore depends on a global communications network to reach its perceived constituents… Its leaders view communications as 90 percent of the struggle.”\(^{147}\) Despite al Qaeda’s initial online prominence, the so-called Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) has completely revolutionized modern terrorism with its use of social media.\(^{148}\)

For ISIS and other terrorist organizations, propaganda serves a bifurcated purpose, and is not only used online. Terrorists’ presence, whether it be in the form of videos, magazines or photos, inspire like-minded individuals to convert to their ideology, but also incite fear and disgust in others.\(^{149}\) Furthermore, terrorist groups can also use propaganda to threaten governments into action that is favourable to their aims. The challenges that face governments who seek to limit the impact of propaganda spread through the internet and social media often lie in the nature of social media. As platforms such as Twitter and Facebook are free to use, and anyone can easily create a new user if their previous account is banned or suspended, limiting the influence of terrorist groups on social

---

media is extremely difficult. A Berger and Morgan study found that, between September and December 2014, at least 46,000 Twitter accounts were used by ISIS supporters.150 Despite the inherent difficulties in countering online terrorist propaganda, there have been instances in which both foreign governments and industries have attempted to diminish the scope of these actions. In 2012 for example, Twitter fundamentally altered its censorship policy to comply with the free-speech policies of certain major countries around the world.151 What this meant was that, for example, in France and Germany, users would be banned from publishing tweets that contained pro-Nazi propaganda, as it is illegal in those countries.152 Additionally, in the United States, after the beheading of American aid worker Peter Kassig in 2014, his family requested that the news media not display any segment of the video published by ISIS, in an attempt to limit the effects it had, in terms of both potential recruitment and in inciting terror, within the United States and abroad.153 Notwithstanding these efforts, online terrorist presence still remains a major medium through which terrorist organizations disseminate their propaganda, recruit, and incite violence around the world.

At previous G7/8 summits, members have focused on the issue of terrorism in the physical world, that is, they have not often considered terrorism in terms of cyber or online terrorism or how the internet affects the dissemination of terrorist ideology and propaganda. At the 2016 Ise Shima Summit, G7 members discussed cyber-security broadly, but did not focus solely on the online aspect of terrorism. The 2017 Taormina Summit was the first time that the G7 members specifically mentioned online terrorism and discussed how to address it.154

Commitment Features

At Taormina G7 leaders thus committed to “counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.”

“Support” refers to the action, or act of providing aid, assistance, or backing up an initiative, or entity.155 “Counter” is to react to something with an opposing opinion or action, or to defend yourself against something.156 “Propaganda” refers to information, ideas, opinions or images, often only giving one part of an argument, that are broadcast, published, or in some other way spread with the intention of influencing people’s opinions.157 “Extremism” is the holding of extreme political or religious views; fanaticism.158 “Radicalization” is the action or process of causing someone to adopt radical positions on political or social issues.159 “Incitement” refers to the action of provoking

---

unlawful behavior or urging someone to behave unlawfully. Lastly, “violence” is behavior involving physical force intended to hurt, damage, or kill someone or something.

The commitment made by the G7 members at the 2017 Taormina Summit is as follows: 1) to combat the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations; 2) to prevent the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the internet; and 3) to avoid the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers.

Examples of what could be done to achieve such ends are as follows:

1. To combat the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations, the G7 member could:
   a) Work towards tackling the global issues such as poverty, illiteracy and poor education that provide terrorist organizations a base from which they can disseminate their propaganda, in physical form or online.

1. To prevent the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the internet, a G7 member could:
   a) Present a positive counter-narrative to targeted groups, and suggest that those who seek to subvert and recruit do so out of malice.

2. To avoid the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers, a G7 member could:
   a) Promote, at the governmental level, the “de-glamorizing” of terrorist organizations and espouse the experiences of significant muslim figures who speak out against the activities of terrorist organizations.

In terms of evaluating G7 members and their compliance to this commitment, they should be judged based on their ability to successfully limit the impacts of terrorist propaganda, and activity, online in relation to their tangible, real-world ramifications. As such, for full compliance the G7 member must take action to 1) counter terrorist propaganda that supports terrorism and violent extremism; 2) counter terrorist propaganda supporting online recruitment; and 3) counter terrorist propaganda supporting radicalization and incitement to violence. Partial compliance results if the G7 member has taken action in only one or two of the three areas, and non-compliance results if no action is taken.
Scoring Guidelines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-1</td>
<td>Member does not apply the necessary means to counter the proliferation of terrorist propaganda, online terrorist recruitment, or the radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Member recognizes the need to limit the proliferation of terrorism through the outlined avenues, however, only counters one OR two of the above facets of online terrorism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+1</td>
<td>Member applies the necessary means to counter the proliferation of terrorist propaganda, online terrorist recruitment, and the radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 26 June 2017, the Interior Ministers and Attorney Generals of Canada, Australia, New Zealand, the United States, and the United Kingdom met at a five ministerial conference in Ottawa. The meeting’s resulting joint communiqué included pledges from the participating Ministers to commit to a series of practices to combat extremist groups. As part of this strategy were tactics that included engagement with key communication service providers, and utilizing traditional and social media to disrupt and counteract terrorist messaging.

On 29 June 2017, Canadian Defence Minister Harjit S. Sajjan and Foreign Affairs Minister Chrystia Freeland announced a renewal of Canada’s commitment to the Global Coalition Against Daesh until 31 March 2019. Among other tasks, the Global Coalition’s mandate includes identifying and countering Daesh propaganda in order to delegitimize the terrorist organization’s recruitment efforts.

On 6 July 2017, the Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence opened calls for proposals for funding from the Centre’s newly created Community Resilience Fund. According to Public Safety Canada, the Community Resilience Fund helps fund organizations seeking to enact programs and research to address radicalization of Canadians. The Community Resilience Fund was allocated an initial CAD 2,400,000 to fund existing and new projects during the

---

2017-2018 period, with another CAD 4,400,000 pledged for 2018-2019, and CAD 7,000,000 each year for 2019-2020 and beyond.\(^{171}\)

On 12 September 2017, Member of Parliament Marc Miller announced on behalf of Public Safety Canada an investment from the Community Resilience Fund to support Project SOMEONE. Project SOMEONE (Social Media Education Every Day) is an online portal, designed to combat hate and radicalization towards violence. The funding for Project SOMEONE is intended to facilitate a better understanding of the production, usage, and online perception of hate speech.\(^{172}\)

On 5 April 2018, Canadian Minister of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Ralph Goodale announced the launch of a public consultation on radicalization. The consultation, housed within the website of the Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence, is designed to gain insight from Canadians on how best to address radicalization towards violence.\(^{173}\)

From 25 April to 26 April 2017, Canadian law enforcement joined with its counterparts in Europe and the US to seize online servers allegedly operated by the Islamic State. Authorities targeted servers operated by Islamic State supporters, including the Aamaq news agency, al-Bayyan radio, and the Halumu and Nasher news sites. These news agencies had previously distributed Islamic State propaganda in the aftermath of several high-profile terrorist incidents in the US and Europe.\(^{174}\)

Canada has recognized the need to counter propaganda that supports terrorism, terrorist online recruitment, and radicalization and incitement to violence. Additionally, Canada has taken sufficient steps for implementing concrete actions against online terrorist propaganda.

Thus, Canada receives a score of +1.

*Analyst: Geordie Jeakins*

**France: +1**

France has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 2 August 2017, France contributed USD 980,600 to the United Nations Development Programme’s Iraq Crisis Response and Resilience Programme to promote recovery and resilience-building in areas previously occupied by terrorist groups such as the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL).\(^{175}\)


On 26 August 2017, the French Minister for Europe and Foreign Affairs Jean-Yves Le Drian and Minister for the Armed Forces Florence Parly have confirmed the provision of EUR 430 million to the Government of Iraq to help post-conflict recovery and reconstruction through humanitarian aid and stabilization efforts with the overall aim to overcome terrorism.  

France also contributed to this effort through its support for UN agencies.

On 13 June 2017, French President Emmanuel Macron and British Prime Minister Theresa May agreed to a joint initiative to tackle online terrorist and criminal activity. The action plan highlights four priorities: improve online illegal content removal, support civil society actors’ counter-narratives, ensure access to data during investigations and develop access to digital evidence for cross-border law enforcement. Regarding access to data during investigations, France and the United Kingdom agreed to retain traffic and location data, share expertise on the identification of subscription holders and share strategies on accessing encrypted content. The aforementioned action plan further mentions other steps, such as calling for an early meeting of G7 interior ministers to broaden its support.

On 13 July 2017, France and Germany launched the Sahel Alliance, a multilateral mechanism aiming at coordinating economic development aid in Burkina Faso, Mali, Mauritania, Niger and Chad to provide faster and more efficient assistance in five sectors: “youth employability – education and training; agriculture, rural development and food security; energy and climate; governance; decentralization and support for the deployment of basic services.”

On 20 September 2017 during the 72nd United Nations General Assembly in New York, President Emmanuel Macron reaffirmed France’s commitment to counter propaganda through the rapid detection and removal of propaganda content on the Internet and support civil society discourse as an essential part of these counter-propaganda efforts. France has implemented new measures to combat online extremism during the compliance period. It has taken concerted efforts to facilitate the fight against the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations as well as facilitate the prevention of the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the Internet. However, France did not take substantive actions to avoid and decrease the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers.

---

On 23 February 2018, French Prime Minister Édouard Philippe announced a National Plan to Counter Radicalization consisting of sixty measures, among which some of them aim at improving the removal of inappropriate content on Internet platforms, supporting the research and development of tools to reduce “algorithmic confinement”\textsuperscript{184} on the Internet, and developing counter-narratives in cooperation with Internet actors and the civil society.\textsuperscript{185}

On 20 March 2018, the Sahel Alliance launched in Mali the “ACTIF” project which aims at providing socio-economic integration and training opportunities for youths. France financed this EUR10 million project through the French Development Agency.\textsuperscript{186}

On 26 April 2018, France took part in the final declaration of the “No Money For Terror”\textsuperscript{187} conference which emphasized active collaboration with the private sector, particularly the digital industry, to “combat […] terrorist content on the internet, in particular terrorist recruitment, violent extremism leading to terrorism, notably through the dialogue initiated by some participating States and international organizations with internet platforms and social networks.”\textsuperscript{188} The declaration also encouraged Internet platforms and social networks to promote civil society’s counter-arguments.\textsuperscript{189}

Thus, France receives a score of +1.

\textit{Analyst: Cécile Amiot}

\textbf{Germany: +1}

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 14 June 2017, Germany’s Family and Interior Ministries announced a new national action plan against racism with a EUR100 million contribution being specifically targeted towards preventing Islamist radicalization and combating Islamic extremism.\textsuperscript{190} Funds are to be utilized in a number of

\textsuperscript{184} Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation – dossier de presse, Service de presse de Matignon (Paris) 23 February 2018. Access Date: 28 April 2018.

\textsuperscript{185} Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation – dossier de presse, Service de presse de Matignon (Paris) 23 February 2018. Access Date: 28 April 2018.


ways including allocation to support mosque communities, while also investing in expanding the prevention of radicalization online.\textsuperscript{191}

On 30 June 2017, German lawmakers approved a controversial law that would impose high fines on social media companies such as Facebook, Twitter, or YouTube for failing to delete explicitly hateful and criminal speech promptly within 24 hours of it being posted.\textsuperscript{192}

On 7 July 2017, the first day of the Hamburg G20 Summit, German Chancellor Angela Merkel stressed that terrorism poses a severe threat to everyone, and has damaging implications on free trade and economic growth.\textsuperscript{193} She also emphasized the importance to share information more effectively as this applies to the world of Interpol, and strengthening the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) to cap terrorists’ sources of funding more effectively.\textsuperscript{194} Merkel made it clear that the German government is making a concentrated effort to open discussion surrounding the internet and terrorism, and has highlighted the need for prompt removal of terrorist propaganda by online media and social networks.\textsuperscript{195}

On 24 August 2017, an amendment was made to the German Criminal Code of Procedure to expand the capacities of German law enforcement agencies to search online digital content and surveil telecommunications networks by exploiting software vulnerabilities without the consent or awareness of the subject.\textsuperscript{196}

On 25 August 2017, Germany successfully banned a left-wing extremist online platform it claimed to incite and fuel violent protests at the G20 summit in Hamburg in July. Interior Minister Thomas de Maizière said the website was shut down as well as it’s networks email, social media accounts, and its license to operate as an organization were cancelled for displaying hate and encouraging indecent behaviours.\textsuperscript{197}

Germany has made sufficient efforts to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, and radicalization and incitement to violence since its attendance at the Taormina Summit in May 2017. Its statements of collaboration with international partners, funding efforts for preventing radicalization, pressuring of social network companies to remove online content, and shutting down of domestic networks has demonstrated a willingness to comply.

Thus, Germany receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Robert Hiff

**Italy: 0**

Italy has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 28 July 2017, Italy’s executive branch, the Council of Ministers, chaired by Prime Minister Paolo Gentiloni, issued press release no. 40 which outlined the approval of a regulation for the protection of personal data. This prohibits the collection of data on persons on the basis of their racial or ethnic origin, religious beliefs, etc., with the significant exception being that personal data can be used in the context of preventing or repressing organized crime, including terrorism.\(^\text{198}\)

On 20 September 2017, Prime Minister Paolo Gentiloni delivered a speech at the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA). In the speech, he reaffirmed Italy’s G7 commitment to counter online recruitment by terrorists by pursuing initiatives to counter their use of the internet and social media.\(^\text{199}\)

On 20 September 2017, Prime Minister Gentiloni along with British Prime Minister Theresa May and French President Emmanuel Macron issued a joint statement in a side-event at the UNGA, which reiterated that Italy is resolved to prevent the misuse of the internet by terrorist groups and individual extremists.\(^\text{200}\) Along with the other two G7 members, Italy clarified its commitment to “working together to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content online and use of the Internet by terrorists to radicalize, recruit, inspire or incite.”\(^\text{201}\)

On 2 November 2017, as per press release no. 55 by the Council of Ministers, new provisions concerning the interception of conversations or communications were introduced under Article 1 of the Criminal Code of Crime. This new provision outlines the contexts under which these interceptions can occur, with the most serious crimes, including terrorism, being the case.\(^\text{202}\)

On 19 February 2018, the Italian parliament issued a legislative decree, in accordance with EU directive 681 of the European Parliament. This legislation outlines the regulatory obligation of internet providers and carriers to communicate data on persons suspected of terrorism and related


serious crimes to the Italian government, in order to prevent, assess, investigate and prosecute offenses of such nature.\textsuperscript{203}

On 30 March 2018, Italian police detained a Moroccan terror suspect, Ilyass Hadouz, on suspicion of “intense jihad propaganda.”\textsuperscript{204} The suspect is said to have perpetuated this propaganda online via home videos and extremist Islamist online chats.\textsuperscript{205}

Italy has made effective contributions towards countering online recruitment by extremists and countering the radicalization and incitement to violence. However, while it has recognized the importance to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, Italy has not taken tangible policy measures to effectively counter these issues.

Thus, Italy receives a score of 0.

\textit{Analyst: Nicolas Di Marco}

\section*{Japan: 0}

Japan has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 15 June 2017, the Japanese parliament passed a new controversial anti-terrorism law designed to preemptively target conspiracies to commit terrorism and other various crimes. The legislation will criminalize the plotting and preparation of 277 specified crimes, including terrorism. Japanese Prime Minister Shinzo Abe defended the new bill, stating to reporters that the anti-terrorism law was needed in order to ratify the Transnational Crime Convention, a United Nations treaty targeting global organized crime, and protect the 2020 Tokyo Olympics.\textsuperscript{206} “We should cooperate with international society to prevent terrorism before it happens,”\textsuperscript{207} stated Abe.\textsuperscript{208}

On 20 September 2017, Taro Kono, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Japan, gave a statement at the Eight Global Counterterrorism Forum Ministerial Plenary Meeting in New York City. There, he stated, “Effective counter-terrorism requires mid- to long-term support to address the root-causes of terrorism in addition to immediate assistance.”\textsuperscript{209} Kono stated that Japan would assist developing countries prone to terrorism on strengthening border security and development solutions, such as poverty alleviation and education support, and conduct further research on how to counter violent extremism.\textsuperscript{210}

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\end{thebibliography}
On 20 October 2017, Hachiro Okonogi, Chairperson of the National Public Safety Commission of Japan, signed on to a joint communiqué with other interior ministers at the G7 Interior Ministers’ Meeting in Ischia, Italy, countering online threats of terrorism.211 The document reads, “Da’esh, al-Qa’ida, and other terrorist and violent extremist organizations continue to exploit the Internet to spread propaganda, recruit operatives, incite violence and inspire attacks.” 212 The ministers encouraged both the private sector and civil society to “develop counter-narratives against [online] terrorist propaganda.”213

Japan recognizes the need to limit the proliferation of terrorism, and has passed measures to counter the preparation of these acts. However, the member has not explicitly applied means to oppose online terrorist recruitment or the online radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.

Thus, Japan receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Ilya Bañares

United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 1 August 2017, former UK Home Secretary Amber Rudd met with senior executives from social media companies at the Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism to urge the industry to step up their efforts in suppressing extremist content and terrorist propaganda on their online platforms.214

On 20 September 2017, at a speech to United Nations General Assembly, Prime Minister Theresa stated that UN members must “work together to tackle the abuse of encrypted messaging apps to plan, direct and coordinate terrorist attacks.”215 That same day, the UK, France, and Italy released a joint statement on effective ways to counter online radicalization, propaganda, and recruitment. Noting that disseminators of terrorist propaganda release such information in rapid and multilateral fashions, the leaders called for “algorithmic confinement.”216 Prime Minister May also met with senior executives from Google, Facebook and Microsoft on the sidelines of the UN meeting to urge

---


the industry to develop new technology that will automatically detect and remove online terrorist content before it is uploaded in the first place.\textsuperscript{217}

On 21 September 2017, the United Kingdom and the Global Solutions Exchange co-hosted an event on Innovations in Civil Society and other Locally Led Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Build Social Cohesion and Resilience.\textsuperscript{218} The event focused on collaborating to build national action plans to prevent violent extremism by creating a more inclusive society.

On 3 October 2017, the British government proposed tangible, legislative measures to target repeated viewers of terrorist content. A Home Office memorandum outlined the framework: “The proposed changes will strengthen the existing offence of possessing information likely to be useful to a terrorist (Section 58 Terrorism Act 2000) so that it applies to material that is viewed repeatedly or streamed online.”\textsuperscript{219} A sentence of up to 15 years would be considered, and attributing it to the aforementioned offence expands on pre-existing applications; “currently the power only applies to online material which has been downloaded and stored on the offender’s computer, is saved on a separate device or printed off as a hard copy.”\textsuperscript{220} Furthermore, the publishing of any information pertaining to public service officials, in civilian or military capacities, to facilitate acts of terrorism, is equally punishable by the newly tabled maximum penalty.

On 9 November 2017, former Home Secretary Rudd pressed tech companies to devise and implement artificial intelligence systems that will automatically detect and block online extremist content before they are posted on their networks at an event hosted by New America, a US think tank.\textsuperscript{221}

On 25 January 2018, Prime Minister May urged investors at the World Economic Forum in Davos, Switzerland, to place more pressure on major technology companies like Facebook and Twitter to respond more quickly to terrorist and extremist content on their online platforms. She stated that investors “can make a big difference here by ensuring trust and safety issues are being properly considered.”\textsuperscript{222} May also stated that tech companies “still need to do more in stepping up to their responsibilities for dealing with harmful and illegal online activity,”\textsuperscript{223} and that governments should “look at the legal liability that social media companies have for the content on their sites.”\textsuperscript{224}

On 13 February 2018, the Home Office announced the development of new technology with ASI Data Science that will utilize advanced machine learning to automatically detect terrorist propaganda


\textsuperscript{221} British official urges social media companies to block militant content, Reuters (London) 9 November 2017. Access Date: 16 May 2018. https://ca.reuters.com/article/technologyNews/idCAKBN1DA065-OCATC.


online. The tool is designed to be used “by any platform, and integrated into the upload process, so that the majority of video propaganda is stopped before it ever reaches the internet.” The Home Office stated that that they will share the methodology behind the new technology with smaller tech firms that are more vulnerable to being targeted by terrorist content than major tech companies.

On 14 February 2018, former UK Home Secretary Rudd joined the US Secretary of Homeland Security Kirstjen Nielsen to participate in the 2018 Digital Forum on Terrorism Prevention in Silicon Valley. They met with tech industry leaders and experts to discuss efforts to counter online terrorist radicalization and recruitment. Both parties “pressed for decisive action against digital terrorist propaganda” and emphasized the importance of public-private collaboration in combating online extremism. At the forum, the UK Home Office and the US Countering Violent Extremism Task Force announced the launch of a new “social media awareness briefing” for the purposes of bringing more awareness of “online terrorist trends” to tech companies in order to “help startups and content moderators increase their understanding of the danger and develop more effective mitigation strategies.”

The United Kingdom has taken significant measures to promote international awareness and dialogue against online extremism; proposed legislative measures aimed at targeting terrorists’ use of the internet; pressed the global technology sector to step up their efforts in countering extremist content and terrorist recruitment on their online platforms; and worked collaboratively with the private sector to produce new technology that will streamline the detection and removal of digital propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism.

Thus, the United Kingdom receives a score of +1.

Analysts: Anders Bretsen and Bryan Rob

---

United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 11 July 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS Working Groups on Counter Finance, Foreign Terrorist Fighters, Stabilization Support and Communications met separately. The discussions focused on the campaign and how to increasingly restrain ISIS.232

On 12 July, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy met with the rest of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS to discuss the means by which to increase efforts to defeat ISIS in Iraq and Syria. Also discussed was how to impact the effect on its branches, affiliates and networks throughout the world.233

On 13 July, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS Small Group met to discuss how to defeat ISIS by strengthening the progress in Mosul and Raqqa. A special meeting was also held for agents from some African countries, the African Union, and the Multinational Joint Task force on ISIS in the Lake Chad Basin region.234

From 29 August to 4 September, 2017, the United States Ambassador-at-Large for Counterterrorism, Nathan A. Sales, travelled to Brussels, London and Paris. There he discussed continuing joint efforts to fight against the terrorism threat in Europe and globally.235

On 20 September, 2017, the United States Global Terrorism Forum published a fact sheet on how to recognize “civilian counter terrorism needs, mobilize the necessary expertise and resources to support capacity building and enhance global counterterrorism cooperation.”236

On 20-21 September, 2017, the United States government partnered with Peru to hold a two-day workshop in Lima, Peru. This workshop was on how to use law enforcement and counterterrorism finance tools to combat Hezbollah’s activities.237

On 3 October, 2017, the United States Acting Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for Political-Military Affairs Michael Miller and Bangladesh Director General for the Americas at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Abida Islam chaired the Sixth U.S.-Bangladesh Bilateral Security Dialogue at the U.S. Department of State in Washington DC. Discussions focused on expanding partnerships in counterterrorism, among other issues.238

On 4 October, 2017, the United States Department of State held the U.S.-China Law Enforcement and Cybersecurity Dialogue in Washington DC. The Dialogue discussed important areas of the U.S.-China relationship on counterterrorism, among other issues.239

On 30 October, 2017, the United States government pledged up to USD 60 million to support the G5 Sahel Joint Forces counter terrorism efforts. It is to support the United States regional partners who are fighting to ensure security and stability against ISIS, affiliated groups and other terrorist networks.240

On 8 November, 2017, the United States and Qatari officials met in Washington D.C. for the first U.S.-Qatari counter terrorism dialogue. The delegations reviewed Qatar’s positive progress in implementing the U.S.-Qatar counterterrorism Memorandum of Understanding signed in Doha on 11 July.241

On 15 November, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS met with key members of the Defeat ISIS Coalition in Amman, Jordan. At the meeting the Coalition partners discussed the next steps to ensure ISIS is dealt an enduring defeat in Iraq and Syria and ways to accelerate their collective approach to defeat ISIS’s global ambitions.242

On 15-16 November 2017, the United States government and the Kingdom of Morocco launched a global initiative to address homegrown terrorism. To address homegrown terrorism, the initiative’s launch brought together over 70 government officials, law enforcement officers, academics, and non-governmental representatives from 25 countries.243

On 14 December 2017, the US met more than 25 governments for the Law Enforcement Coordination Group’s fifth meeting in Europe. The meeting was focused on countering Hizballah’s terrorist activities.244

On 18-19 December 2017, the US took part in the first U.S.-India Counterterrorism Designations Dialogue in New Delhi, India where the discussions focused on increasing bilateral cooperation on terrorism-related designations.245

On 21 December 2017, as a member of the UN, the US adopted a new resolution that will help detect and counter threats from foreign terrorist fighters. The US led the negotiation of this new resolution to demonstrate their commitment to fighting terrorism. This resolution requires all UN members to use Passenger Name Record data, Advanced Passenger Information, to collect biometric

data, develop watchlists of known and suspected terrorists, and encourages UN members to share counterterrorism information with each other.246

On 20 March 2018, the Coordinator for Counterterrorism Ambassador-at-Large, Nathan A. Sales, represented the US in the Thirteenth Coordinating Committee Meeting of the Global Counterterrorism Forum in Tokyo, Japan. Mr. Sales presented a new initiative co-led by the US and Morocco, the Initiative on Improving Capabilities for Detecting and Interdicting Terrorist Travel through Enhanced Terrorist Screening and Information Sharing. The new initiative focuses on potential weaknesses or gaps in states’ capacities to create watchlists and share information.247

On 27 April 2018, US law enforcement teams, along with European teams, disabled key communication channels of ISIS. The eight countries of US, Bulgaria, Canada, France, the Netherlands, Romania, and the UK, engaged in a two-day takedown that targeted ISIS stamped media outlets.248

The United States has recognized the need to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

Thus, the United States receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sonja Dobson

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to countering propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 19 July 2017, the European Commission reported on the actions taken on countering hybrid threats, as were implemented in the 2016 Joint Framework.249 Hybrid threats combine both conventional and unconventional methods such as cyber-attacks and media manipulation.250 This report entailed a description of the Communication Task Forces that had been established between “Eastern and Southern Neighbourhoods,251 the Task Force on Cyber-Security, cooperation with

---

third countries, and cooperation between the EU and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization.252 The European Union used this report to announce the development of an operational protocol that would outline coordination between intelligence collection and analysis regarding online terrorism and resilience in security.253

On 14 September 2017, the European Union adopted a programme worth EUR 17.5 million to address terrorist threats in the Middle East and North Africa. This three-year programme is aimed to address the drivers and threats from terrorism in these regions to build resilience against terrorism and radicalization leading to violent extremism.254 Federica Mogherini, the High Representative and Vice-President of the European Commission, stated that cooperation on counterterrorism would be an increased priority within Europe and with its partners. This programme will strengthen the capacity of state actors in countering terrorism, and will also focus on youth and communities in addressing factors that lead to vulnerability to violent extremism and radicalization.255

On 28 September 2017, President Jean-Claude Juncker accompanied his State of the Union speech (which was held on 13 September 2017) with a presentation of guidelines and principles for online platforms. This new program would increase the “proactive prevention, detection, and prompt removal of illegal content inciting hatred, violence, and terrorism online.”256 This weeding out of illegal content would include a more streamlined process for detection and notification by trusted flaggers and the promotion of investment in automatic detection technologies, effective removal and transparency reports, as well as the prevention of re-appearance and repeated uploading of this illegal content.257 President Juncker stated that the next steps, which are to be completed by May 2018, are to monitor progress of online platforms and to later assess whether additional measures are necessary, including possible legislative measures.258

On 18 October 2017, Commissioner Julian King spoke at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror.”259 In his speech, King addressed the proliferation of radicalization and proliferation of terrorist propaganda, and called on the importance of closing the spaces in which terrorism operates and closing loopholes in terms of recruitment and


means.\textsuperscript{260} He explicitly stated that over 38,000 pieces of content were referred by the Europe internet referral unit, and 85% were removed.\textsuperscript{261} This speech on 18 October 2017 reiterated the success of the European Union’s Radicalization Awareness Network, which connects individuals involved in preventing radicalization and violent extremism throughout Europe.\textsuperscript{262} While this project is ongoing, Commissioner King spoke of success in its working groups such as the Communications and Narratives working group, which acts to deliver on-and-offline communication that counters extremist propaganda, the Education Working Group, which brings together first-line education practitioners to empower them in countering radicalization, as well as the Health and Social Care working group, which interprets signs of radicalization and helps those at risk of incitement to violence.\textsuperscript{263}

On 27 November 2017, EU Commissioner Dimitris Avramopoulos announced at the Eighth Annual Bosphorus Summit, held in Istanbul, Turkey, that the EU Internet Forum had voluntarily partnered with the internet industry, and has regulated and seen to 95% of terrorist content being automatically removed by companies.\textsuperscript{264} Avramopoulos addressed the hope for more companies to join this collaboration, and spoke of the success of the Radicalisation Awareness Network’s reach to countries outside of Europe.\textsuperscript{265}

On 22 March 2018, Commissioner Julian King spoke at the Second Annual EPC/EFD Conference regarding the changes made in the European Union to combat extremism at home and abroad. In this speech, King argued that combating terrorism must not only be through erecting physical barriers, but preventing radicalization of vulnerable European-born citizens. Further, King noted that Rob Wainwright, the Executive Director at Europol, said that there were currently 30,000 individuals in Europe potentially involved in extremist activity. With these rising threats of homegrown extremism, Commissioner King called on online platforms to take greater proactive responsibility for keeping their users safe. The EU has put out a recommendation to require internet companies to take down terror content one hour after being notified by law enforcement as well as to use automatic detection tools to prevent appearance.\textsuperscript{266} Further, these platforms would need to improve


cooperation with law enforcement and to notify these authorities of their identifications of “illegal terrorist content.”

The European Union has made effective contributions to countering propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

Thus, the European Union receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Courtney Amanda Wong