The G7 Research Group at the Munk School of Global Affairs at Trinity College in the University of Toronto presents the

2015 Schloss Elmau G7 Summit
Final Compliance Report
9 June 2015 to 6 May 2016

Prepared by
Michael Humeniuk, Jerome Newton, Christian Medeiros and Kaleem Hawa
with Caroline Bracht
G7 Research Group, University of Toronto

23 May 2016
www.g7.utoronto.ca
g8@utoronto.ca
@g7_rg and @g8rg

“We have meanwhile set up a process and there are also independent institutions monitoring which objectives of our G7 meetings we actually achieve. When it comes to these goals we have a compliance rate of about 80%, according to the University of Toronto. Germany, with its 87%, comes off pretty well. That means that next year too, under the Japanese G7 presidency, we are going to check where we stand in comparison to what we have discussed with each other now. So a lot of what we have resolved to do here together is something that we are going to have to work very hard at over the next few months. But I think that it has become apparent that we, as the G7, want to assume responsibility far beyond the prosperity in our own countries. That’s why today’s outreach meetings, that is the meetings with our guests, were also of great importance.”

Chancellor Angela Merkel, Schloss Elmau, 8 June 2015
Contents

Preface ........................................................................................................................................ 3
  Research Team .......................................................................................................................... 4
  Analysts ..................................................................................................................................... 4
Executive Summary ...................................................................................................................... 5
  The Final Compliance Score ..................................................................................................... 5
  Compliance by Member ............................................................................................................ 5
  Compliance by Commitment ...................................................................................................... 5
  The Compliance Gap Between Members .................................................................................. 5
Future Research and Reports ....................................................................................................... 5
  Table A: 2015 Priority Commitments Selected for Assessment ............................................. 6
  Table B: 2015 G7 Schloss Elmau Final Compliance Scores ................................................... 8
  Table C: 2015 G7 Schloss Elmau Final Compliance Scores by Country ................................ 9
  Table D: 2015 G7 Schloss Elmau Final Compliance Scores by Commitment ....................... 10
1. Macroeconomic Policy: Foster Growth .................................................................................. 11
2. Macroeconomic Policy: Fiscal Flexibility ............................................................................. 19
3. Infrastructure: Infrastructure Investment .............................................................................. 31
4. Gender: Supporting Women Entrepreneurs ......................................................................... 39
5. Financial Regulation: Automatic Exchange of Tax Information ........................................ 47
6. Financial Regulation: Tax Agenda ......................................................................................... 53
7. Terrorism: Terrorists’ Assets ................................................................................................. 61
8. Nonproliferation: Arms Trade .............................................................................................. 70
9. Regional Security: Ukraine ..................................................................................................... 76
10. Regional Security: Maritime ................................................................................................. 84
11. Human Rights: Migrants ...................................................................................................... 94
12. Development: Refugee Crisis .............................................................................................. 103
13. Health: Coordinated Rapid Deployment ............................................................................ 135
15. Health: Vaccines .................................................................................................................. 155
16. Climate Change: Growth Agenda ....................................................................................... 163
17. Climate Change: Low-Carbon Strategies .......................................................................... 172
18. Climate Change: Copenhagen Accord ............................................................................... 183
19. Climate Change: Vulnerable Countries ............................................................................. 192
20. Energy: Liberalizing Systems .............................................................................................. 203

“We thus reaffirm our support for the consistent implementation of and strive to alignment of our own ODA-supported investments with the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security (VGGT) and the CFS Principles for Responsible Investment in Agriculture and Food Systems”

Annex to the Leaders’ Declaration

Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Lack of Compliance</th>
<th>Work in Progress</th>
<th>Full Compliance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Union</td>
<td></td>
<td>+1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td></td>
<td>+0.63</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Background

The maintenance and improvement of food security and agriculture systems is crucial to the eradication of poverty, hunger and malnutrition worldwide. The management of access to natural resources is extremely important as availability fluctuates and the global population increases.

Official development assistance (ODA) is the flow of money, resources or services to regions or countries on the qualified recipient states listed by the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) of the Organisation of Economic Co-operation and Development. For several years, the value of ODA transactions to least developed countries (LDCs) on the DAC list has declined as ODA flows are travelling towards countries that are more economically stable. The implementation of international guidelines is prudent in order to move towards sustainable development and investment.

The first marks of progress towards responsible investment and sustainable agriculture began with the international agreement on the Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure of land, fisheries and forests in the context of national food security (VGGT). The VGGT aim to “[promote] secure tenure rights and equitable access to land as a means for eradicating hunger and poverty.” The endorsement of this agreement on 11 May 2012 by the Committee on World Food Security (CFS) and aided by the European Union have since encouraged implementation by a variety of international groups.

References:

Reinforcing this agreement, in October 2014, the CFS made an international agreement on responsible investment in agriculture and food systems.\footnote{1362} The non-binding agreement deals with a wide range of investments in food and agriculture, and can be used as a structure for the development of programs, national policies, agreements and contracts.\footnote{1363} It represents a collaborative effort to create regulated rules for investing responsibly that help promote nutrition and food security.\footnote{1364}

At the 2015 Elmau Summit, the G7 initiated a collaboration to relieve 500 million people from malnutrition and hunger by 2030.\footnote{1365} This involves the re-endorsement of the commitment of ODA of 0.7 per cent of the gross national income by G7 members.\footnote{1366}

**Commitment Features**

The commitment describes the process of investment through which the leaders aim to reduce hunger and malnutrition. Achieving this goal in the context of responsible investment in agriculture and food systems, the annex of the leaders’ declaration involves implementing ODA-supported investments and private capital in order to “strive to alignment” with VGGT and CFS Principles.\footnote{1367} This suggests the G7 leaders’ aims to reduce hunger and malnutrition lie in ODA investments to LDCs that incorporate both transparent governance and equitable land, agriculture, food and resource tenure.\footnote{1368}

Therefore, measures that are not investments in LDCs and lack transparent governance and equitable tenure of land, agriculture, food or resource, are not the focus of the commitment and do not constitute full compliance. The absence of sustainability in a measure does not help reduce hunger or malnutrition, and also does not constitute full compliance.

Partial compliance involves a member’s responsible investment with transparency and equitable tenure, but directed towards countries other than LDCs. The investment can foster sustainable agriculture or food systems, yet it does not reduce hunger or malnutrition effectively.

**Scoring Guidelines**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-1</td>
<td>Member does not abide by VGGT and CFS in Agriculture and Food Systems Principles of transparent governance and equitable tenure AND does not implement ODA-supported investment to LDCs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Member abides by VGGT and CFS in Agriculture and Food Systems Principles of transparency and equitable tenure BUT does not implement ODA-supported investment to LDCs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+1</td>
<td>Member abides by VGGT and CFS in Agriculture and Food Systems principles of transparent governance and equitable tenure AND implements ODA-supported investment to LDCs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Lead Analyst: Narain Yucel*
Canada: 0
Canada has partially complied with its commitments to food and agriculture by abiding by Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGGT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency and equitable tenure but not implementing new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).

Canada continues to support the New Alliance for Food Security and Nutrition, a partnership consisting of various stakeholders that addresses “key constraints to inclusive, agricultural-led growth in Africa.” The New Alliance for Food Security and Nutrition is committed to the VGGT and CFS principles of equitable tenure and transparent governance. Canada leads the project in Senegal and has pledged a total of CAD80 million to invest in food security and agriculture by 2017. However, this project began before the compliance period and thus will not be considered in the scoring.

Canada is continuing its project, which is expected to end in 2018, to support LDCs such as Mali, Bangladesh, Mozambique and Tanzania by contributing approximately CAD5.5 million to address rural poverty issues including the issue of land tenure. This project also began before the Elmau Summit and will not be considered in the scoring.

Canada has complied with the VGGT and CFS principles of transparent governance and equitable tenure, but failed to implement new ODA-supported investments to LDCs. Therefore, it has been awarded a compliance score of 0.

Analyst: Jerome Newton

France: 0
France has partially complied with its commitment to food and agriculture by adhering to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGGT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency and equitable tenure but not implementing new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).

On 15 October 2015, Minister of State for Development and Francophonie Annick Girardin chaired the meeting of the National Council for Development and International Solidarity. The role of this council is to “enable regular coordination between the different development and international solidarity stakeholders around the goals and guiding principles of French development policies, the coherence of public policies in the area of development and the resources for official development assistance.”

In October 2014, the Agence française du développement (AfD) published an operational guide titled “Guide to due diligence of agribusiness projects that affect land and property rights” intended to guide investors using...
the VGVT framework. France stated that it will “refuse to support projects that go against the principles promoted in the Voluntary Guidelines.”

France continues to support Madagascar’s rural actors through a project, started in 2014, that seeks to improve land tenure. The AfD is financing EUR4 million in this project.

France continues to abide by the principles of transparent governance and equitable tenure but has not implemented new ODA-supported investments to LDCs. Thus, it has been awarded a score of 0.

**Analyst: Doris Li**

**Germany: +1**

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to support the Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGVT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency and equitable tenure and implemented new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).

In 2015, Germany’s Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development launched an initiative to fight malnutrition and provide better food security. Its accompanying report, entitled “A World Without Hunger Is Possible,” highlights key principles of the special initiative which demonstrate Germany’s commitment to the principles of transparency and equitable tenure. The initiative was established in March 2015 but Germany has maintained its support of the program and thereby fulfills its commitment to the G7 mandate.

On 4 September 2015, Germany invested in the placement of 920 solar panels to power the facilities of the International Maize and Wheat Improvement Centre in Texcoco, Mexico. The Centre stores “the world’s largest native biodiversity collections” maize and wheat and works towards producing more resilient crops for farmers in LDCs. The Centre’s Director-General stated “By investing in a sustainable solar energy generating system for CIMMYT’s gene bank, Germany invests in the food security of the world.”

Germany is therefore awarded a score of +1 for full compliance.

**Analyst: Camille Beaudoin**

**Italy: 0**

Italy has partially complied with the agriculture commitment to support the Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGVT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency

---


1379 German investment in CIMMYT helps secure the world’s most important maize and wheat collections, CIMMYT (Mexico City) 3 September 2015. Access date: 28 March 2016. http://www.cimmyt.org/en/where-we-work/global-activities/item/german-investment-in-cimmyt-helps-secure-the-world-s-most-important-maize-and-wheat-collections

1380 German investment in CIMMYT helps secure the world’s most important maize and wheat collections, CIMMYT (Mexico City) 3 September 2015. Access date: 28 March 2016. http://www.cimmyt.org/en/where-we-work/global-activities/item/german-investment-in-cimmyt-helps-secure-the-world-s-most-important-maize-and-wheat-collections
and equitable tenure and implement new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).

From 1 May 2015 to 31 October 2015, Italy hosted EXPO 2015 in Milan — a universal exhibition dedicated to showcasing the best of agricultural technology to be “able to guarantee healthy, safe and sufficient food for everyone, while respecting the Planet and its equilibrium.” Although the Expo 2015 website does offer a “transparency” section, it is not used to discuss how Italy implements the VGGT and CFS standards, but rather, to disclose the transparency policies of EXPO 2015. However, on 9 June 2015, in a statement at the Ministerial Meeting of African LDCs, the President of the International Fund for Agricultural Development claimed that “EXPO 2015 is a testament to Italy’s commitment to food security. And this commitment is also underscored in Italy’s generous support to the Rome-based food agencies.”

On 13 July 2015, Matteo Renzi, Prime Minister of Italy, addressed the United Nations Conference on Financing for Development. He referred to the need for “more concrete international assistance …[referring] to the Least Developed Countries, which deserve increased support to create the basic conditions for the taking off of their own development process.” However, the Italian prime minister did not mention equitable land tenure or the importance of transparency.

Furthermore, in a cooperative partnership with the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Italy is deeply involved in LDCs such as Tunisia and Ethiopia. According to the FAO, “food security has always been at the heart of the FAO-Italy Development Cooperation Programme.” Currently, there are forty ongoing FAO projects supported and funded by Italy. Principally, interventions target the Near East and North Africa, and West Africa and the Sahel. However, there is no disclosure of Italy’s efforts to promote transparency and equitable land tenure.

Despite Italy’s efforts to support various LDCs and promote food security, it has failed to disclose its implementation or support of VGGT and CFS standards. Therefore, Italy is awarded a score of 0.

**Analyst: Camille Beaudoin**

**Japan: +1**

Japan has fully complied with the commitment on the Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGGT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency and equitable tenure but not implementing new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).

A 2014 ODA White Paper published by Japan’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs, it discusses Japan’s future development with its ODA program — namely the new Development Cooperation Charter provides peace and prosperity for Japan and the International community. The charter seeks to extend help for non-

---

1382 Statement by IFAD President at the Ministerial Meeting of African LDCs “Structural Transformation, Graduation and the Post-2015 Development Agenda.
military purposes by building a sustainable international community that addresses health and environmental issues along with other challenges.1387

Since early 2016, the Japanese government has cooperated with the Agriculture Machinery Centre to provide power tillers to Bhutan. Such equipment will be delivered under the KR-II grant program to help mechanize Bhutan’s arable land.1388 Although the amount is yet to be determined, the Japan International Corporation Agency (JICA) maintains that helping to grow Bhutan’s agriculture is an important goal for Japan.1389 JICA provides multilateral aid through international organizations and bilateral aid through assistance directly given to LDCs.1390 Japan is therefore awarded +1 for compliance for abiding by VGGT guidelines and providing ODA-investment to LDCs.

**Analyst: Garrett Hajnal**

**United Kingdom: +1**

The United Kingdom has fully complied with the commitment on the Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGGT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency and equitable tenure but not implementing new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).

The Department of International Development has been vigilant in supporting the efforts of the Food and Agriculture Organization in Zimbabwe by contributing USD48 million to the Zimbabwe Livelihoods and Food Security Program.1391 This program teaches local farmers on smart agricultural practices, increases market accessibility and encourages the growth of more nutritious foods.1392 These efforts continued through 2015.

The United Kingdom has also made a continuous effort to support other projects internationally. Britain provides aid to the Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund (LIFT) in junction with other national donors. The fund attempts to improve the lives of small farmers in rural Myanmar (Burma) through the promotion of climate smart agriculture, development of skills and promotion of better business practices.1393 In addition, LIFT also provides nutrition aid to mothers and children between conception and the child’s second birthday.1394

The UK further supports VGGT guidelines in China, Nigeria and Uganda.

Thus, The United Kingdom is awarded +1 for abiding by VGGT guidelines and providing ODA-supported investments to LDCs.

**Analyst: Garrett Hajnal**

---

1394 ‘Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund’ http://www.lift-fund.org
**United States: +1**

The United States has fully complied with its commitment on the Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGGT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency and equitable tenure but not implementing new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).

In July 2015, the United States/Food for Peace program donated “USD 21.3 million to the EMOP and USD 2 million to Protracted Relief and Recovery, allowing [World Food Programme] to continue vital programs.” This money that was donated was used to combat malnutrition in Jordan.

In 2015, The United States has pledged “[USD] 30 million for the third of three scheduled contributions under IFAD-9.” These funds are directly used by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD), which “help[s] rural small-scale producers and subsistence farmers increase their productivity and incomes, improve food security, and integrate them into larger markets.” These payments are a part of the ninth replenishment of IFAD from the United States and will be re-established in the following year.

Over 2015, the United States donated funds to Feed the Future (FTF), the government’s global hunger and food safety initiative. The FTF “addresses the root causes of hunger and under nutrition, measuring progress through reductions in rates of poverty and stunting. This includes raising incomes of the poor, increasing the availability of food, and improving its nutritional quality.” “With a focus on smallholder farmers, particularly women, FTF supports countries in developing their own agriculture sectors to generate opportunities for economic growth and trade, which help reduce poverty, hunger, and stunting. FTF is also focused on helping to prevent food crises by building the resilience of vulnerable populations.” The United States budget towards FTF is USD900.3 million.

On 28 July 2015, plans were announced for a “commitment of over USD150 million in additional funding for Resilience in the Sahel-Enhanced (RISE), a program helping 1.9 million of the most vulnerable people in the Sahel break the cycle of crisis, escape chronic poverty, and reduce the need for humanitarian assistance. This will bring the total commitment to RISE to approximately USD290 million over five years.”

The US Agency for International Development (USAID) continues two projects to develop land and tenure and property rights in accordance to VGGT. The project on resilience and economic growth in the Sahel is the only new one in 2015, and is in act along multiple other projects that are ongoing which will last beyond 2018. “USAID’s Resilience and Economic Growth in the Sahel — Enhanced Resilience (REGIS-ER) program works to increase the resilience of chronically vulnerable people, households, communities and systems in targeted agro-pastoral and marginal agriculture livelihood zones in Niger and Burkina Faso.”

---

Therefore, the United States is awarded a score of +1 for full compliance.

Analyst: Zachary Medeiros

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with the commitment on by Voluntary Guidelines on the Governance of Tenure (VGGT) and Committee for World Food Security (CFS) principles of transparency and equitable tenure but not implementing new investments supported to official development assistance (ODA) to least development countries (LDCs).


Therefore, the European Union is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Narain Yucel